



APPEAL PROCESS OVERVIEW

Mission

The Board of Appeals is a quasi-judicial body that provides the public with a final administrative review process for appeals relating to a wide range of City determinations. Originally created under the Charter of 1932, the Board strives to provide an efficient, fair and expeditious public hearing and decision-making process before an impartial panel as a last step in the City's permit issuance process.

The Board hears and decides appeals involving the granting, denial, suspension, or revocation of permits, licenses, and other entitlements by various City commissions and departments. The granting or denial of variances and other determinations by the Zoning Administrator, and Discretionary Review decisions and downtown building authorizations of the Planning Commission are included.

Board Structure

The Board of Appeals is comprised of five Board members appointed for staggered four-year terms. Three members are appointed by the Mayor and two by the President of the Board of Supervisors. The Board office is staffed by an Executive Director, Legal Assistant and three Clerks. When an appeal is filed, Board members will conduct a public hearing on the appeal, listening to arguments and testimony from the appellant(s), permit holder(s), Department representative(s), and from interested neighbors and other members of the public. The Board then votes to either uphold the underlying departmental determination, impose conditions on the determination, or overrule the determination.

Limitations on the Board's Jurisdiction

The Board of Appeals has no jurisdiction over permits issued by the Recreation and Park Department or Commission, nor does it hear appeals of criminal matters, domestic relations matters, or other areas regulated by the State of California or the federal government. It has limited jurisdiction over certain permits issued by the Port Commission, pursuant to a Memorandum of Understanding. Its jurisdiction is derived from San Francisco Charter Section 4.106, by provisions in Article 1 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code, and other City ordinances.

Building and demolition permits that are issued pursuant to Conditional Use authorization by the Planning Commission may not be appealed to the Board of Appeals. (S.F. Charter Section 4.106(b).) Appeals of the underlying Conditional Use authorization may be made to the Board of Supervisors but the building or demolition permit may not be appealed to any City government body.

The Board of Appeals has no authority to make amendments to the Planning Code or the Zoning Map, and has no authority to grant Conditional Use authorization. The Planning Department and Planning Commission handle these procedures.

How to File an Appeal

Be On Time

The time limits for filing appeals are strictly enforced. Most appeals must be filed within 15 calendar days from the date of issuance of the underlying departmental decision. For instance, a 15 day filing period applies to building and demolition permits issued by the Department of Building Inspection, Zoning Administrator Notices of Violation and Letters of Determination, and from the date of the letter which issues, denies, suspends, or revokes a permit from most other City Departments. This includes San Francisco Public Works, the Department of Public Health, Police Department, Municipal Transportation Agency Division of Taxis and Accessible Services, and Arts Commission. The 15-day appeal period for Discretionary Review decisions made by the Planning Commission is triggered by the date of issuance of the related building or demolition permit.

Exceptions include:

- Variance decisions issued by the Zoning Administrator must be appealed within 10 calendar days from the date of the variance decision letter.
- Appeals relating to Statements of Eligibility issued by the Zoning Administrator with respect to transfer of development rights must be filed within 20 calendar days.
- Appeals relating to place of entertainment permits, extended hours premises and loudspeaker permits issued by the Entertainment Commission must be filed within 10 calendar days.
- Appeals of Certificates of Appropriateness issued by the Historic Preservation Commission must be filed within 30 calendar days.

When counting “calendar days” the appeal period begins the day after the departmental action became effective. For example, if a building permit is issued on the 3rd day of the month, the last day to appeal would be the 18th day of the month. If the last calendar day falls on a weekend or City holiday, the last day to file the appeal is the next business day.

In limited circumstances, the Board will hear appeals after the filing deadline has passed. For more information, see the section on page 5 below entitled: “What to do if the Filing Deadline Has Passed – Jurisdiction Requests.”

Gather the Needed Paperwork

To file an appeal, a copy of the departmental action being appealed must be submitted to the Board office. For example, a copy of the building permit (front and back) is required when the issuance of a building permit is being appealed.

Planning Department & Planning Commission permit denials: an appeal may not be filed until the Department of Building Inspection (DBI) issues the Notice of Disapproval for the project. The appeal must be filed within 15 calendar days from the date of this Notice of Disapproval. Documents to submit: the building permit application that was denied, with notation by Planning Staff on the back; and the Notice of Disapproval that was issued by DBI.

Monetary penalties imposed by DBI for work done without a permit: the 15-day appeal period is triggered by the date of issuance of the building, plumbing or electrical permit associated with the penalty. Documents to submit: the permit; the receipt issued by DBI that shows the penalty amount paid; and a completed Penalty Questionnaire, which is available at the Board office and on its website.

Make an Appointment

Appeals must be filed in person either by the appellant or the appellant's agent. An agent may be anyone chosen by the appellant, and must provide the Board with written authorization from the appellant allowing the agent to file the appeal in the appellant's name. To make an appointment, please call 415-575-6880. Appointments are available Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.

Meet with Board Staff to Complete the Preliminary Statement of Appeal

Using the Board's computer system, staff will work with appellants or their agents to prepare a Preliminary Statement of Appeal. For all appeals, appellants will be asked to provide a brief statement explaining the reasons for the appeal. This statement may be verbal or in writing. Written statements may be no longer than one double-spaced page. The reasons stated are not binding and additional opportunities are given to state the appellant's arguments both in writing and at the public hearing. No exhibits or other documents are allowed at this time. Staff will set the hearing date and briefing schedule, and will provide the appellant with information about the appeal process.

Pay the Fee

A fee must be paid at the time the appeal is filed. Fees are established by the Business and Tax Regulations Code (Article 1, Section 8) and range from \$100 to \$600, depending on the type of appeal filed. For example, the fee to file an appeal of the issuance of a building permit is \$175 per permit. These fees are non-refundable, whether or not the appeal is successful or is withdrawn prior to the hearing. Fees may be paid by cash or check. Checks should be made payable to the Board of Appeals. See page 7 for the Board's fee schedule.

Submit Briefs & Evidence

The parties to an appeal are encouraged to submit written arguments (briefs) and exhibits to the Board to help Board members understand the case and make a determination. The Rules of the Board set out the briefing schedule and other requirements, and the parties are encouraged to read the Rules and the Board's Special Instructions for Parties for additional information.

- Appellant's Brief is due no later than three (3) Thursdays prior to the hearing date.
- Respondent's or Other Parties' Brief is due no later than one (1) Thursday prior to the hearing date.
- Briefs shall not exceed twelve (12) pages in length, and may include an unlimited number of exhibits.
- Briefs, whether typewritten or handwritten, shall be double-spaced. Typewritten briefs shall be in a font size no smaller than 12 point.
- Late or overlong submittals will be rejected. Please contact the Board in advance of the deadline if you wish to request permission to file late or a longer brief.
- Eleven (11) copies of the brief with exhibits must be delivered to the Board office by 4:30 p.m. on or before the date it is due. Additional copies must be delivered to the other parties on the same day.
- An electronic copy of the brief should be emailed to: boardofappeals@sfgov.org.
- If the hearing date is changed, the briefing schedule may also change. Notice will be sent out by Board staff with any revised briefing schedule.
- Exhibits may include photographs, maps, plans, drawings, letters of support or opposition, or any other information or material relevant to the appeal.

- The Board strongly encourages the submittal of plans or drawings when needed to allow the Board to understand the design or layout of a building that is the subject of an appeal.
- Where exhibits exceed ten pages in length, the Board encourages the submitting party to separate exhibits with tabs and provide a table of contents.
- Additional briefing may not be submitted at the hearing without Board approval; only photographs or drawings may be submitted at that time.

Members of the Public who are not parties to an appeal or affiliated with a party may submit written materials to the Board. In order for these submittals to be considered by the Board prior to the hearing, they should be delivered to the Board no later than one (1) Thursday prior to the hearing date. Eleven (11) copies should be delivered to the Board office. Submittals may also be sent via email to boardofappeals@sfgov.org. This policy is not intended to interfere with the public's rights under the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.

Please note: Correspondence submitted to the Board is available for public review. If a member of the public does not want personal contact information publicly disclosed, they may omit some or all personal contact information from their correspondence; list business instead of personal contact information; or prominently state in their correspondence that they do not want personal contact information disclosed and Board staff will redact it.

What to Expect at the Hearing

The Board of Appeals meets on Wednesday evenings at 5:00 p.m., in San Francisco City Hall, Room 416. City Hall is located at One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102. Meetings are open to the public.

At the hearing, each party will be given time to argue their case and present relevant testimony and evidence. The hearing room is equipped with a projector that can display photographs, architectural plans or other drawings and images. Members of the public will be given time to speak as well.

The appellant speaks first, then the person whose permit or other determination is being appealed, and then a representative of the department that issued the determination. Each speaker is given seven minutes to present testimony and relevant evidence. Members of the public who are unaffiliated with either party (for instance, who are not a party's family member or paid consultant) are then given up to three minutes each to speak. Once the public has spoken, three minutes are given to each party for rebuttal. The Board will then deliberate and either make a decision or continue the matter in order for additional information to be presented.

To prepare for the hearing and to become familiar with the method of presentation used, the Board recommends that the parties observe a meeting of the Board in advance of their hearing. This can be done in person or by watching a hearing on television or via computer. Meetings are broadcast on SFGTV Cable Channels 26 or 78, and may be viewed via streaming video or on demand on the internet at: http://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=6.

Standard of Review

An appellant must get four out of five votes to overturn or modify a departmental decision. In most cases, the Board reviews the departmental decision *de novo*, which means it hears the case anew and is not required to defer to the findings of fact or determinations of the underlying decision-maker. However, in appeals of decisions by the Zoning Administrator (ZA) (except for variance decisions), the City Charter requires that the Board defer to the ZA unless it finds that the ZA erred or abused his or her discretion.

What to do if the Filing Deadline Has Passed – Jurisdiction Requests

After the filing deadline has passed, a person seeking to file an appeal may ask the Board for permission to file late. The process requires filing a Jurisdiction Request which, if granted, establishes a new five day period within which an appeal may be filed.

Prepare a Written Statement

At the time a Jurisdiction Request is filed, a statement must be submitted explaining why the appeal was not filed on time and also briefly outlining the merits of the case. This statement can be up to six (6) double-spaced pages in length with unlimited exhibits, and must conform to the briefing requirements in the Rules. At the time of filing, eleven (11) copies of this statement must be submitted to the Board office along with a copy of the permit or other departmental action for which an appeal is being sought.

The permit holder may submit a response to the Jurisdiction Request no later than ten (10) days from the date the request was filed with the Board. This response may be up to six (6) double-spaced pages in length with unlimited exhibits and must conform to the briefing requirements in the Rules. Eleven (11) copies should be delivered to the Board office by 4:30 p.m. on or before the date it is due. An additional copy must be delivered to the requestor on the same day.

Make an Appointment

The Board asks that an appointment be made to file a Jurisdiction Request. To make an appointment, please call 415-575-6880. Appointments are available Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.

Pay the Fee

A non-refundable fee of \$150 per departmental action is required at the time of filing. The fee may be paid by cash or check. Checks should be made payable to the Board of Appeals. In the event the Board grants the Jurisdiction Request, another fee will be required in order to file the appeal.

What to Expect at the Hearing

The Board will take three (3) minutes of testimony from the appellant, the determination holder and from a representative of the department that issued the determination. Members of the public who are unaffiliated with either party are then given up to three minutes each to speak. The Board will then will discuss the matter and take a vote. This decision is final.

Standard of Review

Four out of five votes are needed to grant a Jurisdiction Request and allow the late filing of an appeal. The Board may grant late jurisdiction only upon a showing by the requestor that the City intentionally or inadvertently caused the requestor to be late in filing the appeal. If a Jurisdiction Request is granted, the requestor will have five (5) days from the date of the Board's decision to file an appeal. (See, Rules of the Board of Appeals, Section V.10.)

How to File a Rehearing Request

If a party to an appeal is dissatisfied with the Board's decision, a Rehearing Request may be filed. Such requests must be filed within 10 calendar days from the date of the Board's decision and may be filed only by the parties to an appeal. The Board may also make a motion to rehear a case at its own initiative. If the Rehearing Request period ends on a weekend or City holiday, the last day to file the request is the next business day. Only one Rehearing Request may be filed per appeal.

Prepare a Written Statement

When requesting a rehearing, a statement must be submitted to the Board explaining why the appeal should be reheard. This statement can be up to six (6) double-spaced pages in length, with unlimited exhibits, and must conform to the briefing requirements in the Rules. At the time of filing, eleven (11) copies must be submitted to the Board office. The other party may submit a response to the Rehearing Request no later than ten (10) days from the date the request was filed. This response may be up to six (6) double-spaced pages in length with unlimited exhibits and must conform to the briefing requirements in the Rules. Eleven (11) copies should be delivered to the Board office by 4:30 p.m. on or before the date it is due. An additional copy must be delivered to the requestor on the same day.

Make an Appointment

The Board asks that an appointment be made to file a Rehearing Request. To make an appointment, please call 415-575-6880. Appointments are available Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.

Pay the Fee

A non-refundable fee of \$150 is required at the time of filing. The fee may be paid by cash or check. Checks should be made payable to the Board of Appeals.

What to Expect at the Hearing

The Board will take three (3) minutes of testimony from the appellant, the determination holder and from a representative of the department that issued the determination. Members of the public who are unaffiliated with either party are then given up to three minutes each to speak. The Board will then will discuss the matter and take a vote. This decision is final.

Standard of Review

Four out of five votes are needed to grant a Rehearing Request. The Board may grant a rehearing request only upon a showing by the requestor that extraordinary circumstances exist and a rehearing is needed to prevent manifest injustice, or new or different facts or circumstances have arisen that if known at the time of the original hearing could have affected the outcome. The written request should state: the nature and character of the new facts or circumstances; the names of the witnesses and/or a description of the documents to be produced; and why the evidence was not produced at the original hearing. (See, Rules of the Board of Appeals, Section V.9.)

Accessibility Information

For information concerning accessibility of the office, hearing room and meetings, please call the Board at 415-575-6880 or email: boardofappeals@sfgov.org. The hearing room is wheelchair accessible and in-room closed captioning is provided. Bilingual staff are available to assist Spanish speaking members of the public, and interpretation services are available for other languages.

More Information

More information about the Board of Appeals, including copies of the Rules of the Board, related Charter and Code provisions, and other resource materials are available at the Board office and on the web at www.sfgov.org/boa.

Fee Schedule

<u>Type of Appeal</u>	<u>Fee</u>
ZONING ADMINISTRATOR VARIANCE	\$600
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(a)(1)	
OTHER ZONING ADMINISTRATOR DECISION: LETTER OF DETERMINATION; NOTICE OF VIOLATION; STOP WORK ORDER REQUEST; PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION	\$600
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(a)(2)	
DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION RESIDENTIAL HOTEL OR APARTMENT CONVERSION PERMIT	\$525
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(b)(1)	
DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION BUILDING, DEMOLITION OR OTHER PERMIT	\$175
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(b)(2)	
DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION IMPOSITION OF PENALTY	\$300
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(b)(3)	
POLICE DEPARTMENT & ENTERTAINMENT COMMISSION PERMIT TO BUSINESS OWNER OR OPERATOR	\$375
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(c)(1)	
POLICE DEPARTMENT & ENTERTAINMENT COMMISSION PERMIT TO EMPLOYEE OR CONTRACT WORKER	\$150
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(c)(1)	
POLICE DEPARTMENT & ENTERTAINMENT COMMISSION PERMIT REVOCATION OR SUSPENSION – OWNERS AND INDIVIDUALS	\$375
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(c)(2)	
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS TREE REMOVAL – WHEN CITY INITIATED ONLY	\$100
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(d)	
OTHER ORDER OR DECISION (TAXI, TOBACCO, MASSAGE, STREET ARTISTS, GENERAL TREE REMOVAL, ENTERTAINMENT AND OTHER PERMITS)	\$300
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(e)	
REHEARING REQUEST – ALL TYPES OF APPEALS	\$150
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(f)	
JURISDICTION REQUEST – ALL TYPES OF DEPARTMENTAL ACTIONS	\$150
Bus. & Tax Reg. Code Art. 1, Sec. 8(g)	

Fees may be paid by cash or check only. Credit cards are not accepted. Checks should be made payable to the Board of Appeals. All fees are non-refundable, whether or not the appeal is successful or is withdrawn prior to the hearing.