

JOURNAL OF PROCEEDINGS
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
ASSESSMENT APPEALS BOARD

In the meeting of Assessment Appeals Board Number 1 for the City and County of San Francisco on Thursday, April 7, 2016, at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Diane Robinson, Joseph Tham and Scott Spertzel

Quorum present

Chairperson: Scott Spertzel, Presiding

The following listed applicant for change in the assessed valuation of property affecting various years of the assessment roll being present, the Board heard legal arguments from both parties regarding whether or not the subject property should be valued as one appraisal unit with the office tower at 555 California Street. The Board took certain action, as specified under this date, on the original of the respective applications:

<u>Appeal No.</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Disposition</u>
2013-0745	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Continued to 1:30 p.m.
2014-0621	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above
2015-0130	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above

The following listed applicants for change in the assessed valuation of property affecting various years of the assessment roll having not been present for hearing as scheduled, the Board took no action, as specified under this date, on the original of the respective applications:

<u>Appeal No.</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Disposition</u>
2014-1063	Stacey Frost Revocable Trust	Postponed
2014-1064	George Gartner Group Trust	Postponed
2015-0276	Adrienne Iann	Postponed
2015-0277	Adrienne Iann	Postponed

RECESS

The Board, at the hour of 12:00 p.m., recessed to reconvene at 1:30 p.m.

RECONVENING OF THE BOARD

The Assessment Appeals Board reconvened at the hour of 1:32 p.m.

Present: Diane Robinson, Joseph Tham and Scott Spertzel

Quorum present

Chairperson: Scott Spertzel, Presiding

With the same parties present from the morning session, the Board continued to hear testimony and evidence from both parties for the following applications regarding whether or not the subject property should be valued as one appraisal unit with the office tower at 555 California Street. The Board also heard testimony from Diana Rosenblack of Vornado Realty Trust regarding the building systems (i.e., electrical, water and HVAC).

At the hour of 2:20 p.m., the Board went into closed session pursuant to Revenue & Taxation Code Section 1605.4 to hear confidential, trade secret evidence and testimony from Angus Scott of CBRE regarding marketing and development of the subject property.

The Board reconvened in open session at 3:15 p.m. and continued hearing legal arguments from both parties regarding valuing the subject property as a single appraisal unit with the property at 555 California Street.

At the hour of 3:25 p.m., the Board again went into closed session pursuant to Revenue & Taxation Code Section 1605.4 to hear confidential, trade secret evidence and testimony from Paul Heinen of Vornado Realty Trust regarding marketing and development of the subject property.

The Board reconvened in open session at 4:06 p.m. and heard cross examination and closed arguments from both parties regarding valuing the subject property as a single appraisal unit with the property at 555 California Street. The Board took certain action, as specified under this date, on the original of the respective applications:

<u>Appeal No.</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Disposition</u>
2013-0745	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Submitted on the legal issue of valuing subject property as one appraisal unit with 555 California Street;
2014-0621	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above
2015-0130	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above

At the hour of 4:55 p.m. the Board went into closed session to deliberate the legal issues raised by both parties regarding above referenced applications. The Board reconvened in open session at 5:05 p.m. and took certain action, as specified under this date, on the original of the respective applications:

<u>Appeal No.</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Disposition</u>
2013-0745	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Continued for Board to meet with its legal counsel; appeal remains under submission
2014-0621	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above
2015-0130	HWA 555 Owners, LLC	Same as above

There being no further business, the Board, at the hour of 5:10 p.m., recessed to reconvene Friday, April 8, 2016, at 9:30 a.m.

Dawn Duran
Administrator Acting as Clerk

Approved by the Board on Wednesday, April 20, 2016

Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors