

**SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF  
ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE  
Meeting Minutes January 16, 2020**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

**Present:** Nina Irani; Russell Tenofsky; Michael Angelo Torres; Annemarie Fortier; John Skeel, SF ACC; Jane Tobin; Brian Van Horn, DVM

**Absent:** Bunny Rosenberg; Officer Ryan Crockett; Lisa Wayne

**2. General Public Comment:**

- Member of the public commented regarding concern that the issue of care for feral mothers and kittens was not on the agenda this month.

**3. Approval of Draft Minutes from November 2019 Meeting**

- Meeting minutes were approved.

**4. Chairperson's and Commissioners' Reports**

A. Commissioner Fortier reported that the new budget proposed by the Governor includes funding to help shelters move towards becoming no-kill.

**5. New Business**

- None.

**6. Old Business**

**A. Euthanasia Protocol at San Francisco Animal Care and Control [Discussion]**

- Commissioner Tenofsky reported on work to change the city code pertaining to euthanasia that will include the wording that all interested parties (such as potential adopters, adoption partners, rescue organizations) and social media be contacted or updated (such as by telephone) within 48 hours of potential euthanasia.
- Commissioner Irani asked about having a representative from SF ACC respond to the proposed changes. ACC Deputy Director John Skeel, who was just recently asked to begin attending Commission meetings, will review and will provide a response at our February meeting.
- Commissioner Tenofsky provided a quick overview to Deputy Director Skeel of previous discussions concerning the protocol that were held during past Commission meetings.
- Commissioner Irani asked about including language concerning disclosure of behavioral issues. Commissioner Tenofsky said that language will be added.
- Two members of the public commented in support of the proposed changes to the city code.

**B. Enforcement of California's Animal Cruelty Law [Discussion/Action Item]**

- Commissioners continued discussing a proposed resolution that supports the enforcement of California Penal Code 597 as it pertains to farm animals, and the activists who were arrested (and charged) at a Sonoma County commercial farming facility. Commissioner Irani provided an overview of events and also reported that the Berkeley City Council passed a similar version of the resolution in November 2019. Commissioner Irani also reported that some of the activists recently accepted plea deals, and that prosecutors have indicated some willingness to exercise some leniency. Jon Frohnmayer, organizer and counsel for Direct Action Everywhere, presented a revised version of the proposed resolution and responded to Commissioners' questions.
- Commissioner Irani asked Mr. Frohnmayer if there were any other updates on his end, and he stated that he had also been offered a plea deal but he had declined it. Commissioner Irani also asked about some of the language changes in the revised version of the resolution, which Mr. Frohnmayer explained were due to recommendations made by a Berkeley City Council member; as well as questions about the farm animal morality rates and some of the

legal opinions provided in the wording. Commissioner Irani also asked about safety and if there was ever physical force used during specific activists' actions. Mr. Frohnmayer explained that he wasn't aware of any force ever being used and called on Amira (an activist) to respond; Amira responded that force is never intentional, and that they hope that violence doesn't happen towards them. Mr. Frohnmayer added that although activists could be harmed by others, they are committed to remaining non-violent.

- Commissioner Fortier asked about the proposed resolution and whether it is within the Commission's realm to request the Board of Supervisors to engage on what another county does and what are the thoughts behind supporting it. Commissioner Irani asked Mr. Frohnmayer to respond, and stated that any portions that are beyond our authority can be removed. Mr. Frohnmayer said he understood the concern and responded that many of the "products" from these facilities are brought in to San Francisco; he also considered this a political prosecution and feels that other city governments should opine to uphold this law. Commissioner Fortier voiced concerns about some of message specific to the activists within the proposed resolution and whether it would fall on welcoming ears, and asked for the thoughts of the other Commissioners.
- Commissioner Tenofsky voiced support for the resolution saying he supports the work of the activists; and as some of the activists are San Francisco citizens, it is within the realm of the Board of Supervisors to take further action to support them. Commissioner Tenofsky also recommended some changes to the wording in the proposed resolution.
- Commissioner Tobin also suggested softening some of the language and emphasizing the non-violent/civil rights aspect. Commissioner Fortier and Commissioner Van Horn suggested additional wording that shows a direct link to San Francisco by indicating some of the activists are city residents, as well as the City's connection to the animals.
- Commissioner Van Horn also asked about Mr. Frohnmayer's current charges, and for an update on USDA regulations and how they stand in regards to the facilities operations. Mr. Frohnmayer explained his current charges and said he did not have an update.
- Commissioner Torres asked about timing and future court appearance. Mr. Frohnmayer mentioned that is a February 20<sup>th</sup> hearing that will probably be moved, and another hearing on March 19<sup>th</sup>.
- Thirteen members of the public spoke in support of activists and the proposed resolution.
- Commissioners discussed the proposed resolution and revisions to the wording. Commissioner Fortier proposed that Commissioners vote to see if Commissioners approve of the resolution as written or with modifications. After further discussion on the wording, it was determined that there would be three changes to the resolution agreed upon by Commissioners, along with an indication that some of those arrested are residents of San Francisco. Commissioner Tobin and Commissioner Irani will work on the final version. After additional discussion, Commissioners felt comfortable with holding a vote on the resolution before seeing the final version.
- Resolution was unanimously passed.

**C. GGNRA Proposed Changes** [Discussion]

- Commissioner Tobin provided an update that the GGRNA hadn't signed the compendium; although it was supposed to have been signed in November 2019 (two pending lawsuits might have put a pause on it).

**D. Commission Governance** [Discussion]

- Commissioner Tobin updated on initial meetings with Supervisor Stefani's and Supervisor Ronen's Offices concerning sponsorship and oversight.
- Commissioner Torres discussed the Commission website and an upcoming training session that he will attend with Commissioner Irani.
- Commissioner Irani discussed updating our *Commissioner Orientation Packet* manual.

**7. General Public Comment**

- Eight members of the public commented on the issues of feral cats and kittens, SF ACC and SF SPCA oversight, and the work of the Commission.

**8. Items to be put on Calendar for Future Commission Meetings**

- A. Euthanasia Protocol at SF Animal Care and Control**
- B. State Shelter Grants/UC Davis**
- C. SF SPCA/ACC Feral Cat Program Changes**

**9. Adjournment** (approx. 7:10 p.m.)