



# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

EDWIN M. LEE  
MAYOR

Sent Via Electronic Mail

August 15, 2017

## NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

**SUBJECT: ANNUAL REPORT ON CERTIFICATION OF ELIGIBLES –  
ENTRY AND PROMOTION – UNIFORMED RAKS OF FIRE,  
POLICE AND SHERIFF.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a meeting to be held on August 21, 2017 at 2:00 p.m. in Room 400, Fourth Floor, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached Notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is welcome. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

*All non-privileged materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission for this item are available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.*

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MICHAEL L. BROWN  
Executive Officer

### Attachment

Cc: Chief Joanne Hayes-White, Fire Department  
Chief William Scott, Police Department  
Sheriff Vicki Hennessey, Sheriff Department  
Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resources  
Susan Gard, Department of Human Resources  
Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources  
John Kraus, Department of Human Resources  
Commission File  
Commissioners' Binder  
Chron

THIS DOCUMENT SUPPORTS  
CALENDAR ITEM 13



## **STAFF REPORT**






# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of  
Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Numbers: **n/a**
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: **August 21, 2017**
3. Check One:  
☐ Ratification Agenda  
☒ Consent Agenda  
☐ Regular Agenda  
  
☐ Human Resources Director's Report
4. Subject: **Annual Report on Certification of Eligibles – Entry and Promotion – Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police, and Sheriff**
5. Recommendation: **Adopt the report.**
6. Report prepared by: **Dave Johnson** Telephone number: **415.557.4871**
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format -A).**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:  
  
Human Resources Director:   
Date: **08-2-17**
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer  
Civil Service Commission  
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

**CSC RECEIPT STAMP**

## NOTIFICATIONS

Chief Joanne Hayes-White  
Chief of Department  
698 Second Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94107-2015  
[Joanne.Hayes-White@sfgov.org](mailto:Joanne.Hayes-White@sfgov.org)

Chief of Police William Scott  
San Francisco Police Department  
1245 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94158  
[william.scott@sfgov.org](mailto:william.scott@sfgov.org)

Sheriff Vicki Hennessey  
San Francisco Sheriff's Department  
1 Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 456  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
[Vicki.Hennessey@sfgov.org](mailto:Vicki.Hennessey@sfgov.org)

Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director  
Department of Human Resources  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413  
[Micki.callahan@sfgov.org](mailto:Micki.callahan@sfgov.org)

John Kraus  
Assistant Deputy Director  
Recruitment and Selection  
Department of Human Resources  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413  
[John.Kraus@sfgov.org](mailto:John.Kraus@sfgov.org)

Dave Johnson  
Manager, Public Safety Team  
Recruitment and Selection  
Department of Human Resources  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413  
[Dave.Johnson@sfgov.org](mailto:Dave.Johnson@sfgov.org)

Susan Gard  
Chief of Policy  
Department of Human Resources  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413  
[Susan.Gard@sfgov.org](mailto:Susan.Gard@sfgov.org)





**DATE:** August 02, 2017  
**TO:** The Honorable Civil Service Commission  
**THROUGH:** Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director  
**FROM:** Dave Johnson, Manager, Public Safety Team  
**SUBJECT:** Annual Report on the Certification of Eligibles - Entry and Promotion - Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police and Sheriff Departments



---

## Background

The Department of Human Resources [DHR] summarizes examination and hiring activities for the San Francisco Fire, Police, and Sheriff Departments in an annual report to the Civil Service Commission [CSC]. This report covers the fiscal year July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2017. As noted in previous reports, some selection processes and projects may be discussed in consecutive annual reports because the work cycle of Public Safety test development and administration can span two fiscal years.

### FY 16-17 Public Safety Appointments

v hires and promotions in the three Departments during the past fiscal year were as follows:

	Job Title	Class	#
	Firefighter	H 2	85
	Firefighter Paramedic	H 3	42
	Inspector, Prevention	H 4	8
	EMT Paramedic	H 8	56
	Lieutenant, Suppression	H 20	20
	Captain, Suppression	H 30	15
	Captain, Prevention	H 32	1
	Captain, EMS	H 33	10
	Battalion Chief	H 40	6
	Assistant Chief	H 50	2
	Marine Engineer	H 110	1
	Police Officer	Q2	156
	Sergeant	Q50	15
	Lieutenant	Q60	25
	Captain	Q80	11

	Deputy Sheriff 1	8302	79
	Senior Deputy Sheriff	8306	14
	Sheriff's Sergeant	8308	11
	Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	4
	Sheriff's Captain	8312	1

## **FY 2016-2017 Examination Activities**

### ***San Francisco Fire Department (SFFD)***

**H-2 Firefighter** – DHR posted the initial eligible list from the Continuous Testing Program on May 11, 2015, and continues to “refresh” the list with new eligibles in conjunction with the needs of the Fire Department. The use of the “FireTEAM” test through the National Testing Network [NTN] continues to provide a diverse, well-qualified pool of candidates for the Fire Department.

**H-3 Level 1 Emergency Medical Technician** – Following an update of the job analysis, the job announcement was issued in April 2017. Of 735 applicants, 452 passed the written test administered on May 21 and 22, and June 10, 2017. Four hundred and thirty nine of those candidates [13 candidates withdrew from the process] were scheduled for the Oral Interview, Skills test, and Physical Ability Test [PAT] administered from June 22 through 29, 2017. Candidates were scheduled to take the Oral Interview and Skills test at the Test Center the same day. Then, also on the same day, they were scheduled to take the PAT at the Fire Department Division of Training at 2310 Folsom St. Although the schedule was complicated logistically, it minimized trips to San Francisco for the candidates. The Fire Department assisted DHR by providing 16 subject matter experts each day to administer the process.

Three hundred and eighty-eight candidates participated in all of the test components. We are currently analyzing the scores from the Oral Interview and Skills test which will establish ranking on the list for those candidates that meet the minimum standard of performance. The PAT is scored pass/fail. The demographics of the eligible list will be discussed in the FY 17-18 report.



**H-4 Inspector, Bureau of Fire Prevention** – DHR conducted a job analysis update, and will convene a committee of subject matter experts from within the Fire Department to assist with test development. DHR plans to conduct the selection process and have a new eligible list shortly after the current list expires on April 1, 2018.

**H-8 EMT Paramedic** – DHR continues to support the Fire Department upon request to open and close this recruitment to ensure sufficient “as-needed” staffing for the Fire Department ambulance fleet.



**H-20 Suppression Lieutenant** – Public Safety Team staff have been working diligently with Fire Department members and staff from a private vendor, Industrial Organizational Solutions, Inc. [I/O Solutions], on the job analysis and test components for this class. The process has been delayed due to appeals of revision to the class specification. The specification was revised to make it consistent with the minimum qualifications standard of five years of experience specified in the last job announcement. The revision has been appealed to the Civil Service Commission [CSC]. Once the appeal is resolved at the CSC, DHR will proceed with posting the announcement. We anticipate test administration in the Fall of 2017, followed by list adoption by the end of 2017.

**H-22 Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Prevention** – DHR is in the process of a job analysis update, and will convene a committee of subject matter experts from within the Fire Department to assist with test development. We anticipate test administration in the Fall of 2017 and list adoption by the end of 2017.

**H-24 Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Investigation** – DHR has finished a job analysis update, and is scheduled to begin work on test development with a committee of subject matter experts from within the Fire Department. Similar to the two lieutenant classifications discussed above, we anticipate test administration in the Fall of 2017, and an eligible list by the end of 2017.

**H-30 Suppression Captain** – The rating of the test answers from 137 candidates [out of 162 scheduled] who participated in both test components took place during two weeks in July 2016. All 137 candidates met a minimum standard for performance and the eligible list was adopted on October 20, 2016.

**H-40 Battalion Chief** – The job announcement was posted in October 2016. Of the 56 applicants who applied, 44 participated in two test components that were administered January 18 and 19, 2017. Those test components (simulated staff meeting, oral interview, and tactical exercises) were developed by I/O Solutions.

All 44 test participants met the minimum standards of test performance and were subsequently placed on the eligible list. The eligible list was adopted on February 22, 2017, eleven days after the expiration of the previous list.

**H-50 Assistant Chief** – It was brought to the attention of test administration staff during administration of the Incident Simulation Exercise on February 20, 2015 that two candidates did not receive a booklet that proctors were supposed to distribute during the test. Fields Consulting Group, the vendor that developed and administered the examination, remedied this inconsistency immediately at the test center. However, DHR later reviewed the video recordings of the candidate test responses and observed that the timely distribution of that booklet was not consistent across test rooms. Therefore, in an abundance of caution to ensure consistent administration, DHR recommended, and Fields Consulting Group agreed, to revise and re-administer that first part of the test. The re-test was successfully administered in October 2016 to 19 candidates. All 19 test participants met a minimum standard of performance on the test, and were subsequently placed on the eligible list. The eligible list was adopted December 21, 2016.

## ***San Francisco Police Department (SFPD)***

**Q-2 Police Officer** – DHR continues testing candidates monthly at the City and County of San Francisco Test Center using the Frontline National test developed and administered by the NTN. DHR also coordinates monthly administration of the physical ability test for Police Officer and the oral exam, so that new candidates [those who pass all three components] are placed on the eligible list every month.

Administration of the Physical Ability Test (PAT) was temporarily suspended while DHR and the Police Department worked with a private vendor, the Human Resources Research Organization, to validate a test of grip strength in order to possibly replace the trigger pull test event. It quickly became apparent that suspension of the PAT was untenable, as suspension of the test would interfere with the department's hiring needs. Therefore the PAT was re-started in its original format while the vendor continued to research a replacement tool for grip strength measurement.

We are pleased to announce that the validation of a new test of grip strength has now been completed. Consequently, the PAT has been modified with a test of grip strength replacing the trigger pull event. The test of grip strength uses the Professional Hand Dynamometer produced by Lafayette Instrument

***Professional Hand Dynamometer***



[see image to the left], and requires “dominant” hand measurement only. Based on the validation study, we anticipate pass/fail rates for the PAT in its new format to be very similar to those for the PAT that included the trigger pull. However, because we have altered the test mid-stream in a continuous testing process, DHR will be inviting candidates who

previously failed the trigger pull test to retake the test in its new format, including the grip strength test.

**Q-50 Sergeant** – The job announcement was issued in October 2016. Of 570 applications submitted, 553 were deemed eligible to participate in the testing process. The written multiple-choice job knowledge test was administered December 7, 2016. Of the 503 candidates participating in the written test, 422 passed and were invited to advance to the Tactical and Roleplay Exercises. Four-hundred and three of the 422 candidates participated in those exercises which were administered on February 14 and 16, 2017, respectively.

DHR and APT Metrics developed a highly valid, interactive Tactical Exercise in order to closely simulate a real-life emergency situation. We used of a live “resource person” through which the candidate could transmit and/or receive information about the scenario as it evolved. Thirty-eight actors were hired to play the role of the resource person. They were trained by APT Metrics for 12 hours, and passed a test on training content prior to the test administration. If successfully administered, the test would





have provided a highly valid predictor of success on the job. However, during a review of the candidate ratings, we discovered that some actors went “off script” despite the training they had received. Although most candidates had no way of knowing whether the information received from the actor was incomplete, incorrect, or excessive, these inconsistencies affected test administration and presented fairness and test validity problems. To remedy the inconsistencies, DHR, in consultation with APT Metrics, decided to discard the exercise and replace it with a new exercise that did not involve actors or resource persons. The replacement exercise was successfully administered on June 13, 2017 to 398 candidates [five candidates elected to withdraw from the selection process]. Candidate test responses will be rated throughout July, with an eligible list to follow.

**Q-60 Lieutenant** – The job announcement was issued in September 2016. Of 206 applications submitted, 200 were deemed eligible to participate in the selection process. One candidate subsequently withdrew from the process, leaving 199 scheduled to participate in the test. DHR worked with I/O Solutions to develop an assessment center consisting of six exercises: a “Sergeant Meeting,” a “Subordinate Meeting,” and a Field Operations Exercise administered on October 20, 2016; and an In-Basket Exercise, a Tactical Exercise, and a “Community Meeting” administered on October 21, 2016. One hundred and fifty-one candidates participated in all six exercises and met the minimum standard of performance on the exercises. Four candidates failed to submit a POST certificate by December 31, 2016 and were, in accordance with the job announcement, disqualified from the selection process. The names of the remaining 147 candidates were placed on the eligible list, which was adopted January 30, 2017.

### ***San Francisco Sheriff's Department (SFSD)***

**8302 Deputy Sheriff** – DHR implemented continuous testing for Class 8302 Deputy Sheriff with the posting of an announcement in October 2016. Between the posting of the announcement and June 30, 2017, we received 1,953 applications. The first testing cycle was administered over three days in December 2016, and resulted in a list of 238 eligibles from among 689 candidates scheduled for the test.



The second testing cycle was administered over six days in February and March 2017. Eight hundred and seventy-seven candidates were scheduled to participate in the test, which resulted in the addition of 184 candidates to the eligible list. Candidates who had not participated in the December test cycle were re-invited to this testing cycle.

The third testing cycle was administered over five days in June, 2017. Invitations were sent to 1,024 candidates, including new candidates and previous no-shows. Of 239 candidates who participated, 118 achieved a passing score and 170 names (including those who possessed POST certificates) were added to the eligible list.

While the show rates are abysmal, passing rates hovering around 40% are also of concern. We have observed that many candidates interested in this particular classification repeatedly apply, but then fail when they take



the test. This coupled with the low “show” rate, reinforces DHR’s interest in transitioning away from the POST test that we are currently using to the Ergometrics video-based test. The latter focuses less on cognitive skills and more on evaluating candidates’ values and judgment. As discussed in other reports, using the Ergometrics video-based test [NTN] rather than the POST test has significantly improved the passing rates for protected classes and, according to the Police Department, the overall quality of the Q-2 candidates. We await data from Sheriff Department subject matter experts and the outcome of Ergometrics’ transportability study to determine whether a change to the video-based NTN test can be supported.

**8312 Sheriff’s Captain** – This selection process was delayed significantly while DHR and the Sheriff’s Department negotiated with the Management Sheriff’s Association [MSA] regarding the class specification. At issue were the duties assigned to the Class, which both Sheriff’s Department and MSA wanted to expand, but struggled at consensus, and the issue of “rank skipping” wherein members two ranks below [i.e., 8308 Sheriff’s Sergeant] qualified to bypass the rank of 8310 Lieutenant and test for 8312 Captain. DHR’s Classification Division worked with the Sheriff’s Department and the MSA to define the duties, and DHR supported the Sheriff in the effort to abolish the rank skipping. The class specification was finally agreed to by all parties and finalized on February 3, 2017, and included the abolishment of rank skipping.

The job announcement was then issued in March 2017. Of 17 applications submitted, 15 were qualified. Two candidates subsequently withdrew from the process leaving 13 scheduled to participate in the test, which consisted of a Human Relations video produced by Ergometrics, an In-Basket Exercise, and a double roleplay Performance Exercise [a meeting with “community” members, followed by a meeting with “Command” staff]. Two candidates failed to show for the test administration. The remaining 11 candidates participated in all three exercises and met the minimum standard of performance on the exercises. The names of the 11 candidates are listed in rank order on the eligible list, which was adopted on July 3, 2017.

### ***Test Center***

DHR and other City departments continue to effectively use the City’s dedicated Test Center at 1740 Cesar Chavez. During FY 16-17, the facility’s main test room was used 246 days, the computer lab 148 days, and the interview rooms 104 days. We again observed an increase in Test Center use compared to the previous fiscal year. This is shown in the table below. Also, there were concurrent events in the Test Center on 69 of the days; a luxury that would not have been possible in the previous facility due to the physical layout.

#### **Days of Facility Usage Across Fiscal Years**

Fiscal Year	Main Test Room	Computer Lab	Interview Rooms
2015-16	206	120	73
2016-17	246	148	104

We anticipate the introduction of fiber optic cable into the facility in FY 17-18, and the installation of 50 new computers. This is important as current use of the facility strains our internet bandwidth capacity. Also, the current number of computers limits testing to candidate populations that are relatively small in size.



Additional computers will afford DHR greater flexibility and speed in administering tests. It will also afford candidates greater convenience (e.g., walk-in testing, learning their test scores immediately, etc.).

### ***Examination Plan for Fiscal Year 2017-18***

In the coming year, DHR plans to administer public safety examinations for the following classifications: H-2 Firefighter [continuous], H-20 Lieutenant, H-22 Lieutenant, H-24 Lieutenant, H-32 Captain, Q-2 Police Officer [continuous], 8302 Deputy Sheriff [continuous], 8308 Sergeant, and 8310 Lieutenant.

### ***Recommendation***

The DHR Public Safety Team appreciates the opportunity to present this report, and respectfully recommends that it be adopted as submitted.