



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

ELIZABETH SALVESON
PRESIDENT

KATE FAVETTI
VICE PRESIDENT

DOUGLAS S. CHAN
COMMISSIONER

F. X. CROWLEY
COMMISSIONER

JACQUELINE P. MINOR
COMMISSIONER

MINUTES Regular Meeting March 16, 2020

2:00 p.m.
ROOM 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

SANDRA ENG
ACTING EXECUTIVE OFFICER

President Elizabeth Salveson	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Elizabeth Salveson presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

David Thompson stated, "I am a San Francisco Fire Fighter. I am a Captain and have been with the department for twenty-three (23) years. It has come to our attention that the H-40 Battalion Chief promotional list has not been extended. Based upon talking to staff at the Fire Department, the Department of Human Resources and Local 798 it has been discovered that this may have been a clerical error. Every test prior to this has been extended for at least one (1) year."

Brian Murphy stated, "I am currently an Acting Captain at Station 17 in the Bayview Hunters Point. The San Francisco Fire Department is very important to me. I take great pride in my job. I am deeply concerned about the situation at hand. I ask that you take immediate and swift action regarding this. Like Dave said, every other list has been extended and this one got skipped."

Danny Gracia stated, "I am the Vice President of the San Francisco Firefighters, Local 798. We have a monthly labor management meeting with the Fire Department Administration. This topic has on the Agenda for many months. As Dave said, all the lists have been extended under this administration. We were taken by surprise this. This is very unusual for this list not to be extended."

Bob Postel stated, "I am an Assistant Chief with the San Francisco Fire Department (SFFD) for twenty-nine (29) years and nine (9) years in my current capacity. I am here to speak to you about the hopefully accidental expiration of the H-40 Battalion Chief's list. It has customarily been the practice with the Fire Department lists of three (3) years is automatically extended to four (4) when there is any remaining eligibles on the list."

Matthew Cannon stated, "I am a Captain with the SFFD. I am here with everyone else to bring this to your attention. I know the Fire Department requested for the extension."

Tom Oertli stated, "I am an Acting Captain with Station 40. I have been with the department a little over twenty-six (26) years. I think one key issue we were told by our administration that this would happen. We believe this is a mistake. I hope you quickly ratify it."

Adrienne Sims stated, "I am one of the Directors with Local 798. I drive Battalion Chiefs which is my job. I am an Incident Support Specialist. What is not being said here is how important this rank is. This rank is on scene first and is the first incident commander on the scene to take charge of a major disaster, active shooter, or major fire. It is imperative whoever is in that seat is well versed on the standard operating procedures to keep San Francisco safe."

Scott Darmstadt stated, "I am an Acting Battalion Chief serving three (3) districts in San Francisco, including the Mission, the Excelsior and the Hunters Point Bayview District. This is an issue that not only affects me but my family. This is an issue that is affecting the morale at the fire houses and the confidence in the administration and the department."

Claudio Rivieccio stated, "I am currently an Acting Captain at Station 10. I have been in that position since October 2019. As my coworkers have stated the unfortunate result of the expired list affects not only of the employees directly applying for promotion but the other Firefighters whose promotions would be affected such as mine. I am asking, along with the others who are affected by this error, that we be given the opportunity to promote in our field because of our hard work, commitment, dedication, and advance skills."

Arnold Choy stated, "I am currently an Acting Captain at the San Francisco Fire Department. We are asking the Commission to help resolve this issue."

Mathew Alba stated, "I am currently a Captain with Station 41. I was on the H-40 eligible list before the test was eliminated. I have been a member of this department of nineteen (19) years. I am here as a matter of principle. I am here to impress on you that individuals on this list have trained, studied and prepared for this test with the understanding of past presence being observed where promotional eligibility lists have been extended to a fourth year."

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of March 2, 2020

Action: Adopted the minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Special Meeting of March 6, 2020

Action: Adopted the minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

None.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)

0076-20-1 Diversity Recruitment 2019 – 2020. (Item No. 5)

Action: Postponed to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No. 6)

0075-20-1 Mid-Year Report FY 2019-20. (Item No. 6)

Action: Postponed to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0067-20-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46715-19/20	Controller	\$2,000,000	The Office of the Controller requires professional service to implement a new enterprise budget system to support the City's budget development process and produce the biennial budget. The City has an annual budget of \$12.3 billion and approximately 38,000 budgeted full-time equivalent employees. The new system will replace the City's current budget system, Budget and Performance Management System ("BPMS"). BPMS is an IBM Cognos/Oracle server-based application which is supported by the Controller's Office and used by all City departments. BPMS is the system of record for the official budget for the City and is approaching end of useful life.	Regular	4/1/2023

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of March 16, 2020

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42467-19/20	Department of Emergency Management	\$750,000	Contractor will provide web design services to support and sustain the execution of an upgraded website to better promote the Urban Areas Security Initiative (UASI) program and its regional projects. The enhanced website will be easy to navigate, provide for a grants management system for partner jurisdictions to perform fiscal grants management activities, and have enough capacity to allow for the additional of audio/video presentations, webinars, and other multi-media needs.	Regular	8/31/2024
43424-19/20	City Administrator	\$6,000,000	Provide a site where the Department of Public Works (DPW) and other City departments can deposit truckloads of asphalt grindings, concrete and other materials that are generated as a by-product of the City's Street Paving Program and provide for proper disposal of materials brought to that site.	Regular	12/30/2024
46268-19/20	Human Services Agency	\$200,000	<p>A. Survey Develop an electronic survey instrument in collaboration with Family and Children's Services (FCS) leadership to be used with community partners and stakeholders. The survey should be simple and brief in order to fully engage the target audiences without being an administrative burden.</p> <p>B. Targeted Interviews FCS employs approximately 400 people with approximately 75 staff in the early intervention units, which include hotline, intake and non-court family maintenance (NCFM). The successful Respondent will develop an outline with FCS leadership for targeted questions to be used to guide interviews and will complete interviews with approximately 50% of the staff from the targeted units, along with selected staff from the remaining units and management. Contractor will also conduct 30 to 50 interviews with stakeholders. The interview format will include identified, research-based factors known to shape organizational climates including but not limited to messaging from supervisors, clear protocols, and support from leadership.</p> <p>C. Focus Group The successful Respondent will complete up to 10 focus groups of stakeholders and staff the opportunity to offer solutions and constructive feedback in shaping the climate that guides the practice of San Francisco public child welfare. A focus group format will be developed and approved in collaboration with FCS leadership. The format will promote both verbal discussion and responses and the opportunity to be thoughtful before responding in the group setting. Allowing Respondents to think independently before having to be a part of a group response will be included as a best practice in capturing meaningful input.</p> <p>D. Reports The successful Respondent will use the results from the survey, targeted interviews, and focus groups to inform a description of the climate at the Early Intervention units and make recommendations for improving the organizational context within Early Intervention. The report will be submitted to FCS leadership in draft form for review. Once feedback from SF leadership has been gathered, revisions will be completed, and a final report will be submitted.</p>	Regular	6/30/2021

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of March 16, 2020

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47672-19/20	Port	\$1,300,000	Organize, implement, and administer a program to primarily provide economically-disadvantaged and/or at-risk San Francisco youth ages 16 through 24 with paid work experience to help maintain the Port's property including weed abatement, hand watering and manual fertilization of Port plants, graffiti removal, and litter removal. The grantee will hire, provide work-readiness training, and supervision for up to ten youth employees, during the summer and school breaks. During the school year, the grantee will also provide work-readiness training and supervision for up to ten youth employees but for fewer hours per week than during the summer and school breaks. The grantee will need to provide two first-line supervisors. In order to adequately perform program overview, the grantee will also need to employ at least one (1) Program Coordinator.	Regular	2/29/2024
44773-19/20	Public Utilities Commission	\$925,000	The purpose of this contract is to purchase one (1) new decanter centrifuge assembly with control system. The new control system involves a service by a system integrator to incorporate existing equipment into the new centrifuge control system such as the existing sludge conveyor, sludge pump, polymer pump, flowmeters, etc. wastewater Enterprise's (WWE) Southeast Plant has six centrifuges total in Building 840. The equipment purchase is estimated to be \$805,000 and the service work is estimated to be \$120,000 (~13% of the total cost).	Regular	12/31/2023
47433-19/20	Public Utilities Commission	\$18,000,000	SFPUC intends to award up to four (4) agreements, at \$4.5 million each to perform specialized Engineering Design Services on an as-needed basis to supplement SFPUC and other City Staff. Civil, structural, electrical, mechanical engineering and other specialized engineering needed to complete utility engineering projects.	Regular	8/27/2025

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of March 16, 2020

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46231-19/20	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$2,000,000	<p>The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) is soliciting contractor services of one or more firms to act as financial advisors to the SFMTA. The contractor will be chosen from the list of pre-qualified firms compiled by the San Francisco Controller's Office. The contract would be for a term of up to five years. The consultant must demonstrate experience with, and knowledge of, transportation, municipal, California and San Francisco issuers and financings, including public agencies similar to the SFMTA.</p> <p>The following delineates a concise description of proposed work:</p> <p>Financial Planning Services The contractor shall consult with SFMTA and City officials, bond counsel, disclosure counsel, underwriter, and rating agencies to review and update the SFMTA's financial plan for future financing transactions. The contractor will provide guidance on the timing, structure and method of raising capital for proposed transactions in the financial plan. The contractor will also keep the SFMTA abreast of changing state and federal laws in connection with the SFMTA's financings and will be available to provide assistance and advice on any legislative issues impacting the SFMTA.</p> <p>Debt Management Services The contractor will update and maintain schedules for the SFMTA's Outstanding Debt Summary. The contractor will analyze the debt structure and provide a determination. The contractor will assist in the preparation, review and adoption of all legal documents and for drafting, printing, and distributing all disclosure documents prior to the bond sale. The contractor will closely monitor all local, national and international developments and evaluate the potential impact of each event on a new-issue of tax-exempt securities. The contractor will also assist with securing a line or letter of credit when necessary.</p> <p>The contractor will develop a presentation and coordinate the introduction of SFMTA as a new issue to the three major rating agencies, Moody's Investors Service, Standard & Poor's Corporation and Fitch Ratings. The contractor will recommend the rating firms to be used, if necessary, and prepare and present such information as is required to receive a rating.</p> <p>The contractor will provide the SFMTA with market information relating to comparable issues in the market, comparisons of takedown levels and important economic data releases. The contractor will provide the SFMTA with a Final Pricing Report so that the SFMTA can evaluate the fairness of the pricing of the bonds.</p> <p>The contractor will work with all parties involved with the closing to prepare a schedule of tasks to be completed prior to closing and identify the party responsible for completing the task. These tasks include completing the final official statement, preparing closing documents, arranging for the transfer of funds and the investment of funds.</p> <p>Financial Analysis Services The contractor will provide the SFMTA with financial analytical support for specific projects and preparation of grant proposals.</p> <p>Other Services The contractor will provide other financial services as requested by the SFMTA.</p>	Regular	5/31/2025
40189-19/20	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$200,000	<p>The consultant will provide required training to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) police service dogs (K-9 unit) and their handlers on explosives detection in accordance with Transportation Security Administration (TSA) standards. The canines and police officers will then be qualified and TSA-certified to work when explosives detection is required within the SFMTA transit system.</p>	Regular	1/31/2025

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of March 16, 2020

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49312-15/16	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$1,420,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,250,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,670,000	The contractor will provide consulting services for the modification and customization of Customer Relationship Management (CRM) proprietary software used to manage the City's service requests. When required, vendor service assist City staff extend the functionality of the application while training staff to make additional improvements.	Modification	12/31/2022
4129-11/12	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$1,026,600 Increase Amount Requested \$50,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,076,600	The proposed work has three components. First, the Contractor will provide on-going 24/7/365 access for the application, and maintenance services for the comprehensive web-based database application, the Shared Youth Database, which is a customized database that creates matched records for children adolescent clients served by the Department of Public Health, San Francisco Human Services Agency, San Francisco Juvenile Probation Department and San Francisco Unified School District. This data base is used to identify opportunities for early intervention, care planning, practice improvement, and research. Second, the Contractor will complete building a data dashboard and associated reports using data obtained from Avatar, the behavioral health electronic health record. Third, the Contractor will build Clinical Reports, specifically ANSA (Adult Mental Health Outcome measure) reports that mirror those they previously built for CANS (Child/Youth outcome measure). The Data Dashboard and Clinical Reports components will involve the development of the reports, followed by training DPH IT staff to create similar new reports or modify existing reports using Crystal Reports. The training component is critical in that these reports require more complex programming than is typically done within Avatar and we are committed to building internal capacity to produce and maintain reports with the Avatar environment.	Modification	6/30/2025
44680-14/15	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$1,245,000 Increase Amount Requested \$550,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,795,000	Tuberculosis physician services for the delivery of prevention, diagnostic and treatment services for and related to all forms of tuberculosis and to build capacity for the elimination of Tuberculosis (TB) in San Francisco. Additional services to be provided by physicians include and are not limited to X-Rays, Computerized Tomography (CT) scans, collaborative mentorship of medical students, residents, junior faculty, interns, resident fellows and public health officials. Scope Change: Only physician services are included under this PSC.	Modification	6/30/2024
42163-13/14	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$9,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$4,500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$14,000,000	The scope of work is to augment, assist and support Program Controls Support Bureau (PCSB) staff as-needed in developing and updating detailed, resource loaded project and program schedules with work breakdown structure and major milestones; providing construction Critical Path Method (CPM) scheduling support services, including review and recommendation for time extension entitlements; forecasting and recommendation for time extension entitlements; forecasting and monitoring status of project schedules and budgets at completion; implementing change control management measures; establishing and maintaining the Primavera-based Program Control System for all capital improvement projects such that San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC)/City and County of San Francisco software systems can be utilized in conjunction with PCSB Program Control System for scheduling and cost, and change control/management.	Modification	9/30/2022

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of March 16, 2020

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49268-17/18	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$4,470,000 Increase Amount Requested \$300,000 New Total Amount Requested \$4, 770,000	The contractor(s) will provide services to the Health Information Management (HIM) unit throughout the course of the San Francisco Department of Public Health Electronic Health Record (SFDPEHR) project. Service areas will include: project management and consulting services in support of the consolidation of HIM functions across the San Francisco Health Network; pre-implementation and implementation phases specifically in the area of workflow evaluation, design and redesign; coordinating evaluating and determining the quantity of staff training; and overall oversight of HIM functions during post-EHR implementation.	Modification	12/31/2021
47706-16/17	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$1,390,000 Increase Amount Requested \$500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,890,000	The initial engagement will be in support of a task force established by the Board of Supervisors in preparation for the possible legalization and regulation of adult use and possession of cannabis, the Cannabis State Legalization Task Force, begun in early 2016, to be active for a two-year period. The Task Force is comprised of 22 members, including non-voting representatives of City departments such Planning, Fire, Police, Building Inspection and Public Health and voting members from various sectors, including advocates, business and tourism sector representatives. Services will include assistance in planning; identifying best practices, legal mandates and other relevant information; determining the stakeholder needs; facilitating meetings and handling task force/project documentation and communications; development of findings and recommendations; and making large and small group presentations.	Modification	5/31/2023

Speakers:

Jacquie Hale, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #44680-14/15.

Action:

1. Approved PSC #44680-14/15 with the condition the Department of Public Health amend PSC Form 1, Question 6B to provide additional information regarding the training component and refer to the Acting Executive Officer. (Vote of 5 to 0)
2. Approved PSC #43912-15/16 with the condition the General Services Agency amend PSC Form 1, Question 6B and address the training component and refer to the Acting Executive Officer. (Vote of 5 to 0)
3. Adopted the report and approved all remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts. Notify the Office of the Controller and Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0063-20-1 Bi-Annual Summary of Appealed Future Employment Restrictions Placed by the SFMTA. (Item No. 8)

Speaker: None.

Action: Postponed to a future meeting. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0068-20-1 Follow up report on Strategic Planning and Diversity Recruitment Strategies for Higher Level Leadership Positions of SFMTA. (Item No. 9)**Speaker:** None.**Action:** Adopted the staff report. (Vote of 5 to 0)**0077-20-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Service Contract Number 43972-19/20. (Item No. 10)**

PSC#	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43972-19/20	Fire Department	\$5,000,000	Contractor will provide specialized Employee Assistance Program (EAP) to members of several of the City's First Responder agencies and their dependents. This will be a multi-agency program, and the Fire Department will take the lead on the contract. The two agencies starting the program will be the San Francisco Police Department and the San Francisco Fire Department, with the possibility of the Sheriff, Medical Examiner, and Dispatch (DEM) participating at a later date. The services will include, but not be limited to, specialized outpatient behavioral health services, and critical incidence stress response services.	Regular	6/30/2023

March 2, 2020: Approve the Fire Department's request to postpone to the meeting of March 16, 2020.**Speaker:** None.**Action:** Adopt the reported. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract Number 43972-19/20; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)**0285-19-6 Appeal by Juliet Valerio of the Human Resources Director's Determination to Administratively Close Appellant's Complaint of Harassment and Discrimination. (Item No. 11)****Speaker:** None.**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of April 20, 2020 at the request of Juliet Valerio. (Vote of 5 to 0)**0241-19-4 Appeal of the Rejection of Application by Daniel Boreen for 7251 Track Maintenance Supervisor I – Cable Car Specialty. (Item No. 12)****February 3, 2020:** Postponed the item to the meeting of March 16, 2020 at the request of Daniel Boreen.**Action:** Granted the appellant's request for postponement to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0014-20-4 Appeal by Brock A. Davis of the Denial to File an Application for the 8310/8510 Sheriff's Lieutenant Examination After the Close of the Official Filing Period. (Item No. 13)

Speaker: None.

Action: Continued the item to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0154-19-6 Appeal by Stephanie Winston of the Human Resources Director's Determination to Administratively Close Her Complaint of Harassment and Retaliation. (Item No. 14)

October 21, 2019: Postponed the item to November 18, 2019 by mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

November 18, 2019: Continued the matter pending the possibility of mediation and report back within three (3) months, by February 2020 or earlier

Speaker: None.

Action: Continued the item to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0193-19-6 Appeal by Eric Utley of the Human Resources Director's Determination to Administratively close His Complaint of Retaliation. (Item No. 15)

Speaker: None.

Action: Continued the item to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0194-17-7 Request for Hearing by Alejandro Alvarez on His Future Employment Restrictions with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 16)

December 16, 2019: Continued to March 16, 2020 by mutual agreement between MTA and Alejandro Alvarez.

Action: Continued the item to a future meeting date. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public comment on all matters pertaining to Items #18 and #19. (Item No. 17)

None.

Vote on whether to hold Item #19 in closed session. (Item No. 18)

Action: The Commission voted to hold Item #19 in closed session. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Basis for closed session: Personnel Exception (Gov. Code §54957(b)(1), Admin Code §67.10(b)); California Constitution Art. I, sec. 1.

0029-20-1 Closed Session – PUBLIC EMPLOYEE APPOINTMENT. (Item No. 19)

Possible Action Item - Title: Executive Officer

February 3, 2020: No action was taken.

February 11, 2020: The Commission did not select candidates to interview and voted to make that determination at a closed session meeting to be held on March 2, 2020. In addition, an attempt will be made to determine interview questions.

March 2, 2020: The Commission disclosed that it made further progress with the employee appointment and will continue the item to the Special Meeting held on March 6, 2020.

March 6, 2020: The Commission conducted interviews of potential candidates and narrowed the pool. The Commission will now proceed to the next step of the selection process which is to receive written work from the candidates.

The Closed Session started at 3:02 p.m. and ended at 3:40 p.m. in City Hall, Room 400 and the following individuals were present:

Elizabeth Salveson, President, CSC
Kate Favetti, Vice President, CSC
Jacqueline Minor, Commissioner, CSC
F.X. Crowley, Commissioner, CSC
Douglas Chan, Commissioner, CSC

Reconvene in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions on Item #19 in closed session (S.F. Admin. Code §67.12 (a)) (Item No. 20)

Action: The Commission voted not to disclose the discussions held in Closed Session for Item #19. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Action: The Commission disclosed no action was taken. (Vote of 5 to 0)

CONTINUITY OF OPERATIONS DISCUSSION (Item No. 21)

President Salveson directed the Acting Executive Officer, Sandra Eng to only calendar items of essential business as defined in the Health Officers order of March 13, 2020. In addition look into teleconference meeting.

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 22)

Commissioner Crowley requested staff to review allegations brought forth in a recent newspaper article which alleges the Department of Public Works (DPW) hiring several individuals in temporary exempt positions. Commissioner Crowley is requesting staff to look DPW and determine if the department is compliant with Civil Service actions and Rules.

Commissioner Chan also requested clarification on the Civil Service Commission's jurisdiction regarding H-40 Battalion Chief eligible list not being extended.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 23)

The Commission adjourned at 4:01 p.m.