




CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Numbers: **n/a**
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: **September 17, 2018**
3. Check One:
 - Ratification Agenda
 - Consent Agenda
 - Regular Agenda
 - Human Resources Director's Report
4. Subject: **Annual Report on Certification of Eligibles – Entry and Promotion – Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police, and Sheriff**
5. Recommendation: **Adopt the report.**
6. Report prepared by: **Dave Johnson** Telephone number: **415.557.4871**
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format-A).**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:

Human Resources Director: 

Date: **8/22/18**
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

CSC-22 (11/97)

<u>CSC RECEIPT STAMP</u>

NOTIFICATIONS

Chief Joanne Hayes-White
Chief of Department
698 Second Street, 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94107-2015
Joanne.Hayes-White@sfgov.org

Chief of Police William Scott
San Francisco Police Department
1245 3rd Street, 6th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94158
william.scott@sfgov.org

Sheriff Vicki Hennessey
San Francisco Sheriff's Department
1 Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 456
San Francisco, CA 94102
Vicki.Hennessey@sfgov.org

Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Micki.callahan@sfgov.org

Kate Howard
Deputy Director
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Kate.Howard@sfgov.org

Dave Johnson
Manager, Public Safety Team
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Dave.Johnson@sfgov.org

Susan Gard
Chief of Policy
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Susan.Gard@sfgov.org





DATE: Aug. 17, 2018
TO: The Honorable Civil Service Commission
THROUGH: Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director
FROM: Dave Johnson, Manager, Public Safety Team
SUBJECT: Annual Report on the Certification of Eligibles - Entry and Promotion - Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police and Sheriff Departments

Background

The Department of Human Resources [DHR] summarizes examination and hiring activities for the San Francisco Fire, Police, and Sheriff Departments in an annual report to the Civil Service Commission [CSC]. This report covers the fiscal year July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2018. As noted in previous reports, some selection processes and projects may be discussed in consecutive annual reports because the work cycle of public safety test development and administration often occurs across fiscal years.

FY 17-18 Public Safety Appointments

New hires and promotions in the three departments during the past fiscal year were as follows:

	Job Title	Class	#
	Firefighter	H 2	91
	Firefighter Paramedic	H 3	43
	Inspector, Prevention	H 4	1
	Investigator, Investigation	H 6	1
	EMT Paramedic	H 8	35
	Lieutenant, Suppression	H 20	24
	Lieutenant, Prevention	H 22	6
	Lieutenant, Investigation	H 24	1
	Captain, Suppression	H 30	16
	Captain, EMS	H 33	3
	Battalion Chief	H 40	8
Assistant Chief	H 50	1	
	Police Officer	Q2	166
	Sergeant	Q50	76
	Lieutenant	Q60	30
	Captain	Q80	9

	Deputy Sheriff 1	8302	82
	Senior Deputy Sheriff	8306	1
	Sheriff's Sergeant	8308	22
	Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	8
	Sheriff's Captain	8312	5

FY 2017-2018 Examination Activities

San Francisco Fire Department (SFFD)

H-2 Firefighter – DHR posted the initial eligible list from the Continuous Testing Program on May 11, 2015, and continues to refresh the list with new eligibles in conjunction with the needs of the Fire Department. The use of the FireTEAM test through the National Testing Network [NTN] continues to provide a diverse, well-qualified pool of candidates for the Fire Department. NTN implemented a new test beginning in May 2018. The new test features new scenarios while measuring the same competencies as the previous test. NTN is currently validating another test component which, in early studies, has shown to significantly increase the overall predictive value of the test. Following completion of the study, and pending positive results, DHR anticipates meeting with NTN experts and Fire Department staff to consider inclusion of the new test component as part of the process to becoming a San Francisco Firefighter.

H-3 Level 1 Emergency Medical Technician – The selection process administered in FY 16-17 produced a diverse list from which the department is making selections. The demographics of the pool of eligibles are shown in the table below.

Race	Female	Male	Totals
American Native	2	0	2
Asian	2	35	37
Black	14	10	24
Filipino	1	5	6
Hispanic	6	60	66
White	30	119	149
Totals	55	229	284

There are also 37 candidates on the eligible list not included in the table above because they did not self-identify race and/or sex on their application. While 321 total eligible candidates will likely provide a pool sufficient for a three-year list [with a possible for extension to a fourth year], the data above shows a continuing need for outreach in conjunction with the next selection process to attract a pool that reflects our community.

H-4 Inspector, Bureau of Fire Prevention – Upon request from the Fire Department, this selection process was delayed for a period of months. The job announcement was subsequently issued in February 2018. Out of 151 applications received during the filing period, 147 were deemed qualified. Four applicants did not demonstrate that they met the minimum requirements, and their applications were rejected. Of the 147 qualified candidates who were scheduled for the first test component, only 79 participated. This 54% show rate is somewhat surprising for a Fire promotion, but not for this particular class. This position is heavily

focused on Fire and Building Code standards, which they aren't exposed to in the regular performance of their duties as firefighters. If they haven't adequately prepared for the test they withdraw, knowing that lack of Fire and Building Code study will likely result in poor performance. This is in contrast to Lieutenant in suppression, the other promotive line for firefighters, wherein they are exposed to the duties of a lieutenant every day they work.

Three additional candidates did not participate in the second component, resulting in 76 candidates completing the test in June 2018. Scoring is complete and DHR anticipates an eligible list in September 2018. The 2018-19 annual report will include discussion of the eligible list.

H-20 Suppression Lieutenant – After a several month delay to resolve an appeal of revisions to the class specification, the job announcement was issued in September 2017. Out of 315 applications received during the filing period, 311 were deemed qualified. Four applicants did not demonstrate that they met the minimum requirements, and their applications were rejected. Out of the 311 candidates invited to participate in the first component, a situational judgement test [SJT], 278 attended. One of those test participants was subsequently disqualified based on the discovery that he omitted that he was permanent in Class H-6



Investigator—members in that class did not qualify for the selection process. That candidate appealed the disqualification to the CSC, who upheld the disqualification. After extensive score analysis, a pass point was set for the SJT. The pass point resulted in five members failing the test component, and 272 passing. Of the 272 candidates scheduled for the second and third components of the test [administered in December 2017], 248 participated. Following another round of score analysis, a pass

point was set for the aggregate score from the second and third test components. This pass point resulted in 230 candidates passing the test, and 18 failing the test. The eligible list containing the names and scores of those 230 candidates was posted and subsequently adopted on March 1, 2018.

H-22 Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Prevention – The job announcement was issued in September 2017. Out of 41 applications received during the filing period, 35 were deemed qualified. Six applicants did not demonstrate that they met the minimum requirements [e.g., they were temporary rather than permanent in the underlying classes¹], and their applications were rejected. Out of the 35 invited to participate in the two test components [an in-basket exercise, and a roleplay exercise], 32 attended. All 32 candidates passed the test and are on the eligible list. The eligible list containing the names and scores of those 32 candidates was posted and subsequently adopted on January 11, 2018.

H-24 Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Investigation – The job announcement was issued in September 2017. All 14 applications received during the filing period were deemed qualified. Out of the 14 invited to participate in the two test components [an in-basket exercise, and a roleplay exercise], 10 attended. All 10 candidates passed the test and are on the eligible list. The eligible list containing the names and scores of those 10 candidates was posted and subsequently adopted on January 11, 2018.

As a side note, of the 42 eligibles across the two classes, eight eligibles are on both lists (H-4s and H-6s) and qualify for either of the Lieutenant positions.

¹ Permanent appointees in Class H-4 Inspector and Class H-6 Investigator qualify to test for both H-22 and H-24 Lieutenant.

San Francisco Police Department (SFPD)

Q-2 Police Officer – DHR continues testing candidates monthly at the City and County of San Francisco Test Center using the Frontline National Test developed and administered by the NTN. DHR also coordinates monthly administration of the physical ability test (PAT) and oral exam for police officer, so those who pass all three components are placed on the eligible list every month.

You may be aware that jurisdictions across the nation are currently facing a challenge to find qualified candidates to fill current and anticipated police officer vacancies. A number of possible causes for this candidate shortage cited are the “Ferguson Effect”, low unemployment, and an upcoming generation who may not want a “career” job. Regardless of what is causing this latest challenge, DHR anticipated and proactively sought solutions. We recognized back in 2013 that we needed to be more receptive to the needs of candidates who would not wait for a test (or on an eligible list) for three or four years to be a police officer. This recognition precipitated, with the support of this CSC, our affiliation with NTN, resulting in a dramatic increase in the opportunity to apply for and take the test. Although this exposure initially provided a surplus of candidates from which to choose, the advantage has diminished as many local jurisdictions [e.g., Oakland and San Jose, etc.] are now also affiliated with NTN.

Our next approach has been to decrease the time it takes the successful candidate to advance through the selection process and achieve standing on the eligible list. We are limited in what we can do with the time that passes between the written test and subsequent components because we have to await scores and allow time to schedule and send notices to candidates. However, based on our analysis, we now schedule the oral exam and PAT on subsequent days, thereby eliminating approximately 30 days from the filing of an application to placement on the eligible list.

In addition to tightening the timeline, we re-evaluated other points at which we were losing candidates, the largest of which is between application filing and registering with NTN to take the written test. We are losing approximately 50% of our applicants at this step in the process in spite of monthly reminders that registration to take the test is the next step, and that there is confidential assistance available for anyone who cannot afford the cost of registration. In an effort to make the appeal more attractive, we have partnered with the Police Department [PD] Recruitment Team to issue notices directly from the PD. The PD Recruitment Team also calls candidates individually to offer encouragement and ascertain their level of interest.

Just recently we obtained a list of approximately 2,400 prospective candidates from the PD Recruitment Team who were contacted through recruitment events. We will compare this list against our applicant pool to provide them a metric on the effectiveness of their recruitment efforts.

Commissioners may recall that DHR conducted a study to validate a new grip strength test using a hand dynamometer to replace the PAT trigger pull. The new test has been part of the PAT for one year. We are pleased to announce that the grip strength test has proven to be as effective a predictor of success as the trigger pull, while showing a slightly higher passing rate. This higher passing rate allows for that percentage of candidates to “train up” to graduating the Academy as opposed to being eliminated from the process at the PAT. The other three events of the PAT [sit ups, pushups, and the wall agility run] remain the same.



Professional Hand Dynamometer

Q-50 Sergeant – Following the completion of test administration through rating of candidate responses in July 2017, DHR posted and subsequently adopted an eligible list on August 28, 2017. The list contains the 366 candidates who passed the test. The list duration is three years, with the possibility of a one-year extension.

San Francisco Sheriff's Department (SFSD)

8302 Deputy Sheriff – Commissioners may recall that DHR implemented continuous testing for Class 8302 Deputy Sheriff in October 2016. The instrument for differentiating candidate performance was the POST Pellet-B test. The use of this test for continuous testing proved problematic in that whenever DHR interpolated new candidate scores into the eligible list, ranks of candidates already on the list changed, and DHR, in accordance with CSC rules, was obligated to notify any eligible whose rank changed. Given the limitations of our current applicant tracking system, this process was very cumbersome and time consuming. One option we explored was to establish fixed ranks similar to those used for entry-level firefighter and police officer. Unfortunately, POST could not provide statistics from which we could calculate psychometrically-based score ranges we could convert to fixed ranks.

To resolve that issue, and to accommodate a request from Sheriff Vicki Hennessey to measure “emotional intelligence”, DHR researched available test instruments and identified the REACT test from Ergometrics as optimal for 8302 continuous testing. The REACT test is video-based, has a much lower cognitive load than the POST test, and measures emotional intelligence through situational judgement questions. In addition, Ergometrics provided statistics in the form of standard error of measurement we used to identify score ranges we convert to fixed ranks. Now, when we interpolate new scores into the eligible list, no ranks change.

Following a transportability study that demonstrated the predictive value of the test, we posted an announcement in March 2018. DHR then tested over 300 candidates and used those test scores as the basis for cut-scores on the four components of the REACT test. After application of the cut scores, the aggregate pass rate is approximately 59%, which is significantly higher than the 37% pass rate that the POST test most recently produced. Although it is too soon to tell, we will inquire with the Sheriff's Department as to their opinion of the quality of the candidates identified through the REACT test versus the POST test. As we have indicated in previous reports, both Fire and Police believe the video-based testing produces a pool of candidates that better fit the job than the previously used written multiple-choice tests.

8308 Sheriff's Sergeant – The job announcement was issued in November 2017. Out of 184 applications received during the filing period, 183 were deemed qualified. One applicant did not demonstrate meeting the minimum requirements, and that application was rejected. One hundred fifty three of the 183 qualified candidates participated in the first test component, REACT Promote from Ergometrics, which included a measure of emotional intelligence. All 153 test participants were subsequently scheduled to take the roleplay exercise administered in February 2018. Out of the 153 candidates invited to participate in the roleplay exercise, 132 attended. All 132 candidates passed and are on the eligible list. That eligible list was posted and subsequently adopted on March 23, 2018. The list duration is two years, and may be extended for a third year.



8310 Sheriff's Lieutenant – The job announcement was issued in November 2017. Out of 17 applications received during the filing period, 14 were deemed qualified. Three applicants did not demonstrate they met the minimum requirements, and their applications were rejected. All 14 qualified candidates participated in

the first test component, the REACT Promote from Ergometrics. Although this is the same test as used for 8308, the value of specific answers varies by the rank for which the candidate is testing. In other words, the best answer in a given scenario may not be the same for the two ranks. All 14 participants were subsequently scheduled to take the in-basket and roleplay exercises. However only 11 of the invitees participated in both exercises. All 11 passed the test and were placed on the eligible list. That eligible list was posted and subsequently adopted on March 23, 2018. The list duration is one year, and may be extended for a second year. The one-year duration was requested by the Sheriff given the limited number of permanent appointees in the underlying class at the time. DHR will likely administer the selection process again this fiscal year to coincide with list expiration.

Test Center

DHR and other City departments continue to effectively use the City’s dedicated test center at 1740 Cesar Chavez. During FY 17-18, the facility’s main test room was used 209 days, the computer lab 113 days, and the interview rooms 96 days. This is shown in the table below.

Days of Facility Usage Across Fiscal Years

Fiscal Year	Main Test Room	Computer Lab	Interview Rooms
2015-16	206	120	73
2016-17	246	148	104
2017-18	209	113	96

While facility use by DHR non-public safety and other departments is fairly consistent over time, the decrease in test center usage as compared to the previous fiscal year can be attributed to a decrease in the number of public safety selection processes administered this last fiscal year. Based on the number of public safety selection processes to be administered in FY 2018-19, we anticipate usage similar to the year just finished, with another increase in usage during FY 2019-20.

The introduction of fiber optic data cable into the facility earlier this year has provided us with the necessary bandwidth to roll out more computer-based testing. DHR is in the midst of deploying 50 new computers, and working with staff from DTIS to establish internet connectivity throughout the facility.

Examination Plan for Fiscal Year 2018-19

DHR plans to administer public safety examinations in the coming year for the following classifications: H-2 Firefighter [continuous], H-6 Investigator, H-32 Captain, Q-2 Police Officer [continuous], 8302 Deputy Sheriff [continuous], and 8310 Lieutenant.

Recommendation

The DHR Public Safety Team appreciates the opportunity to present this report, and respectfully recommends that it be adopted as submitted.