

# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED MAYOR

Sent via Electronic Mail

April 4, 2019

F. X. CROWLEY
PRESIDENT

ELIZABETH SALVESON VICE PRESIDENT

> DOUGLAS S. CHAN COMMISSIONER

> > KATE FAVETTI COMMISSIONER

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

SUBJECT: SALARY SURVEY FOR REGISTERED NURSE

CLASSIFICATIONS (CHARTER SECTION A8.403),

2019-2020.

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a meeting to be held on <u>April 15, 2019 at 2:00 p.m.</u> in Room 400, Fourth Floor, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached Notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings. The meeting agenda and all meeting materials will be posted on the Civil Service Commission's website at <a href="www.sfgov.org/CivilService">www.sfgov.org/CivilService</a> under "Meetings" no later than end of day on Wednesday, April 10, 2019.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is welcome. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting.

MICHAEL L. BROWN
EXECUTIVE OFFICER

All non-privileged materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission for this item are available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MICHAEL L. BROWN

Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resources

David Canham, SEIU Local 1021

Susan Gard, Department of Human Resources Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources Steve Ponder, Department of Human Resources

Mark Leach, Teamsters Local 856

Ron Weigelt, Department of Public Health

Commission File

Commissioners' Binder

Chron

|  |  |  |   | · |  |
|--|--|--|---|---|--|
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  | · |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |
|  |  |  |   |   |  |

### **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

| 1.   | CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER NUMBER: 0097-19-3  |
|------|--|
| 2.   | FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING OF: April 15, 2019  |
| 3.   | CHECK ONE: CONSENT AGENDA  |
|      | REGULAR AGENDA   |
| 4.   | SUBJECT: SALARY SURVEY FOR REGISTERED NURSE CLASSIFICATIONS (CHARTER SECTION A8.403), 2019-2020  |
| 5.   | RECOMMMENDATION: ADOPT REPORT; CERTIFY TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR THE ACUTE CARE NURSING CLASSIFICATIONS THE HIGHEST PREVAILING SALARY SCHEDULES IN THE SIX BAY AREA COUNTIES (PUBLIC & PRIVATE) IN EFFECT ON APRIL 15, 2019. |
| 6.   | REPORT PREPARED BY: CLAIRE MCCALEB TELEPHONE NUMBER: 557-4898  |
| 7.   | NOTIFICATIONS: SEE ATTACHED  |
| 8.   | REVIEWED AND APPROVED FOR CIVIL SERVICE AGENDA: HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR:  |
|      | DATE: 444  |
| 9.   | SUBMIT THE ORIGINAL TIME-STAMPED COPY OF THIS FORM AND PERSONS TO BE NOTIFIED (SEE ITEM 7 ABOVE) ALONG WITH THE REQUIRED COPIES OF THE REPORT TO:  |
|      | EXECUTIVE OFFICER CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION 25 VAN NESS, ROOM 720 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102   |
| 10.  | RECEIPT-STAMP THIS FORM IN THE "CSC  RECEIPT STAMP" POY TO THE PICKET LISTIC THE   |
| 1.50 | RECEIPT STAMP" BOX TO THE RIGHT USING THE TIME-STAMP IN THE CSC OFFICE   |

ATTACHMENT

#### **NOTIFICATIONS:**

David Canham Service Employees International Union, Local 1021 350 Rhode Island, Suite 100 South San Francisco, CA 94103

Mark Leach Teamsters, Local 856 453 San Mateo Avenue San Bruno, CA 94066

Ron Weigelt Department of Public Health Human Resources Office 101 Grove Street San Francisco, CA 94102

Micki Callahan Department of Human Resources 1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Kate Howard Department of Human Resources 1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Steve Ponder
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Susan Gard
Department of Human Resources
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Claire McCaleb Department of Human Resources 1 South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

#### City and County of San Francisco London Breed Mayor



#### Department of Human Resources Micki Callahan Human Resources Director

TO:

The Honorable Civil Service Commission

FROM:

Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director

SUBJECT:

Salary Survey of Registered Nurse Classifications, 2019-2020

(Charter Section A8.403)

RECOMMENDATION:

Adopt Staff Report; forward to Board of Supervisors

Charter Section A8.403 requires the Civil Service Commission to certify to the Board of Supervisors the highest collective bargaining salary schedule, at the maximum, for acute care nurses in the six Bay Area counties as of April 15th of each year. It also requires that the Board of Supervisors set a rate of pay for such nurses which does not exceed the schedule certified by the Civil Service Commission.

The Charter specifies: At the time the Board of Supervisors fixes the salary schedule as provided, the Board of Supervisors may fix as conditions and benefits of employment other than salaries as compensation for each classification, conditions and benefits not to exceed the intent of those conditions and benefits granted by collective bargaining agreements to comparable classifications by the employer used for certification of the highest prevailing salary schedule by the civil service commission. The Board of Supervisors may establish such conditions and benefits notwithstanding other provisions or limitations of this Charter, with the exception that such conditions and benefits shall not involve any change in the administration of or benefits of the Retirement System, health service system or vacation allowances provided elsewhere in this Charter.

The City and SEIU Local 1021 are currently in the third year of a three-year collective bargaining agreement covering the City's registered nurses. The purpose of this certification is to demonstrate that the value of wages and benefits provided by that collective bargaining agreement conform to the limits provided by the Charter.

The Department of Human Resources is submitting to the Civil Service Commission for certification to the Board of Supervisors the following:

#### I. Certification of the Highest Prevailing Salary Schedule

The highest prevailing salary schedule, at maximum, in effect on April 15, 2019 for the acute

Date: April 15, 2019

care staff nurse classification granted by collective bargaining agreement is \$90.32 per hour. This was determined after conducting a survey of the following Bay Area hospitals and medical centers: Alameda County Medical Center, Contra Costa County Regional Medical Center, Kaiser Permanente Medical Care, Marin General Hospital, San Mateo County Medical Center, Santa Clara Valley Medical Center, Stanford Medical Center, and UCSF Medical Center. The survey includes both public and private entities. Given the competitive nature of the labor market, maintaining the confidentiality of the private organizations is essential to ensuring their future cooperation, and consistent with salary survey best practices. Therefore, the highest payer will not be indicated by name, because the medical center specifically provided this data on the condition of anonymity. It should be noted that the medical center with the highest prevailing salary schedule, at maximum, for a journey-level nurse rate is \$9.76 higher per hour than our current hourly rate of \$80.56. For the purpose of this report, the medical center with the highest prevailing salary schedule, at maximum, will be referred to as "Medical Center A."

Some pertinent facts regarding the wages and conditions of the survey:

- 1. The survey confirmed with Medical Center A that the classification duties, responsibilities and minimum qualifications of its nurses are comparable to those of the CCSF Registered Nurse classification. The survey matched the level that is considered the journey-level classification.
- 2. It should be noted that Medical Center A requires 30 years of service to reach the maximum wage rate. Registered nurses employed by the City and County of San Francisco require only 21 years to reach the maximum wage rate. At 21 years, Medical Center A is approximately \$6.34 higher per hour than our current hourly rate of \$80.56.

## II. Certification of the wage and benefit hourly difference between the City and County of San Francisco and the employer with the highest prevailing wage rate

Since Medical Center A's Clinical Nurse II rate of pay exceeds that of the City and County of San Francisco's Registered Nurse, the attached table is provided to establish the dollar difference of maximum salary plus the dollar value of health, vacation and applicable benefits, pursuant to Charter Section A8.403(f), between CCSF and Medical Center A's comparable journey-level nurse classification.

#### A. Health Benefits

The relevant collective bargaining agreements provide for basic health care for nurses and their dependents. Medical Center A pays \$1,025.58 to \$3,120.42 per month per nurse, i.e. \$12.82 to \$39.01 per hour for health, dental, and vision insurance. The City

Date: April 15, 2019

and County and SEIU Local 1021 current collective bargaining agreement establishes the model for employee health and dental insurance premiums. The City and County pays from \$671.93 to \$2,397.70 per month per nurse, i.e. \$3.88 to \$13.83 per hour for health, dental, and vision insurance, depending on which health and dental plan the nurse chooses. Medical Center A's maximum benefit of \$3,120.42 per month exceeds the City & County's maximum contribution of \$2,397.70 by approximately \$4.17 per hour.

#### B. Paid Time Off

1. Medical Center A's collective bargaining agreement contains provisions for paid time off accruals to be used for vacation, illness, holidays, family emergencies, religious observances, preventative health and dental care, and other excused elective absences. Paid time off is accrued depending on length of service.

Medical Center A nurses accrue the following number of days off:

| First through tenth year                    | 41 days off earned |
|---|--------------------|
| More than tenth year through fifteenth year | 44 days off earned |
| Fifteenth year through twentieth year       | 47 days off earned |
| Twentieth year and subsequent years         | 50 days off earned |

The City and County of San Francisco's equivalent benefits (vacation, paid sick leave and holidays) are as follows:

| First through fifth year                     | 37 days off earned |
|--|--------------------|
| More than fifth year through fifteenth year  | 42 days off earned |
| More than fifteenth year and subsequent year | 47 days off earned |

2. In addition, the City and County has a Longevity Leave provision of 1 to 6 days depending on length of service. The value of this benefit ranges from \$0.25 to \$1.86 per hour. Medical Center A does not offer this benefit.

#### C. Summary of Wages and Benefits

The total hourly dollar value of Medical Center A's Staff Nurse II for wages and benefits at the maximum rate of pay and 30 years of service exceeds the wage rate and like benefits for the City and County of San Francisco by \$14.88 per hour.

Date: April 15, 2019

#### D. Additional Notes

Because no actuarial information was available from the private institutions surveyed, we are unable to note any information regarding retirement comparisons.

#### III. Recommendations

1. Adopt Staff Report; certify to the Board of Supervisors Medical Center A's Staff Nurse II rate of \$90.32 is the highest prevailing wage rate in effect on April 15, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

Steve Ponder

Classification and Compensation Director

# COMPARISON OF WAGES AND BENEFITS

Medical Center A's Clinical Nurse II and The City and County of San Francisco's Registered Nurse as of April 15, 2019

| 31,5      | 30,5      | 29.5      | 28.5      | 27.5      | 26.5      | 25.5      | 24.5      | 23.5      | 22.5      | 21.5      | 20,5      | 19.5      | 18,5      | 17.5      | 16.5      | 15.5      | 14.5      | 13.5      | 12.5      | 11.5      | 10.5      | 9.5       | 8,5       | 7.5       | 6.5       | 5.5       | 4.5       | 3.5       | 2.5       | 1.5       | 0.5       | 0         |          | Service     | . 9                 | T Call |
|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|-------------|---------------------|--------|
| \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$80.56   | \$78.20   | \$78.20   | \$78.20   | \$78.20   | \$78.20   | \$75.84   | \$75.84   | \$75.84   | \$75.84   | \$75.84   | \$75.84   | \$73.53   | \$73.53   | \$73.53   | \$71.33   | \$69.20   | \$69.20   | \$67.10   | \$65.25   | \$63.26   | \$61.34   | \$61,34   | Hourly   |             | CC87                | )      |
| 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | φ         | ဖ         | ဖ         | မှ        | φ         | œ         | 00        | ග         | æ         | 00        | œ         | 7         | 7         | 7         | ග         | ()i       | ĊΊ        | 4         | ω         | 2         |           |           |          |             |                     |        |
| \$90.32   | \$90.32   | \$88.53   | \$88.53   | \$88.53   | \$88.53   | \$88.53   | \$86.90   | \$86.90   | \$86.90   | \$86.90   | \$86.90   | \$85.22   | \$85.22   | \$85.22   | \$85.22   | \$85.22   | \$83.53   | \$83.53   | \$83.53   | \$83.53   | \$83.53   | \$81.90   | \$81.90   | \$81.90   | \$80:30   | \$80.30   | \$80.30   | \$77.51   | \$74.82   | \$72.23   | \$69.70   | \$66.40   | Hourly   |             | NIC A               | 3.60 5 |
| 12        | 12        | 7         | ⇉         | =         | 7         | 1         | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | 10        | ဖ         | ဖ         | ဖ         | ဖ         | ဖ         | œ         | çα        | œ         | တ         | ço        | 7         | 7         | ~         | О         | თ         | თ         | Сh        | 4         | ယ်        | N         | _         |          |             |                     |        |
| (\$9.76)  | (\$9.76)  | (\$7.97)  | (\$7.97)  | (\$7.97)  | (\$7.97)  | (\$7.97)  | (\$6.34)  | (\$6.34)  | (\$6.34)  | (\$6.34)  | (\$8.70)  | (\$7.02)  | (\$7.02)  | (\$7.02)  | (\$7.02)  | (\$9.38)  | (\$7.69)  | (\$7.69)  | (\$7,69)  | (\$7.69)  | (\$7.69)  | (\$8.38)  | (\$8.38)  | (\$8.38)  | (\$8.97)  | (\$11.10) | (\$11.10) | (\$10.41) | (\$9.57)  | (\$8.97)  | (\$8.36)  | (\$5.06)  | (under)  | DVEI/       | CCOF                | 2      |
| \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13,83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13,83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13.83   | \$13,83   | \$13,83   | \$13.83   | Hourly   |             |                     |        |
| \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18,00   | \$18,00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | \$18.00   | Hourly   |             | NIC A               | 100    |
| (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (\$4.17)  | (under)  | DVer/       | 000                 | 200    |
| 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 42        | 37        | 37        | 37        | 37        | 37        | 37        | 37        | Days     | *           | ŧ<br>Ic             | `      |
| \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.56   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14,14   | \$12.25   | \$12.25   | \$12.25   | \$12.25   | \$12.25   | \$12.25   | \$11.88   | \$11.88   | \$11.88   | \$11.52   | \$9.85    | \$9.85    | \$9.55    | \$9.29    | \$9.00    | \$8.73    | \$8.73    | Value    | nouny       | CSF                 | 2      |
| 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 50        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 47        | 4         | 4         | 4         | 4         | 44        | 41        | 41        | 41        | 41        | 41        | 41        | 41        | 4         | 41        | 41        | 41        | Days     | *           |                     | 5      |
| \$17.37   | \$17.37   | \$17.03   | \$17.03   | \$17.03   | \$17.03   | \$17.03   | \$16.71   | \$16.71   | \$16.71   | \$16.71   | \$16.71   | \$15.41   | \$15,41   | \$15,41   | \$15.41   | \$15.41   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$14.14   | \$12.92   | \$12.92   | \$12.92   | \$12.66   | \$12.66   | \$12.66   | \$12.22   | \$11.80   | \$11.39   | \$10.99   | \$10.47   | Value    | . Tourly    | , A                 | >      |
| (\$2.81)  | (\$2.81)  | (\$2.47)  | (\$2.47)  | (\$2.47)  | (\$2.47)  | (\$2.47)  | (\$2.15)  | (\$2.15)  | (\$2.15)  | (\$2,15)  | (\$2.57)  | (\$1.27)  | (\$1.27)  | (\$1.27)  | (\$1.27)  | (\$3.16)  | (\$1.89)  | (\$1.89)  | (\$1.89)  | (\$1.89)  | (\$1.89)  | (\$1.04)  | (\$1.04)  | (\$1.04)  | (\$1.14)  | (\$2.81)  | (\$2.81)  | (\$2.67)  | (\$2.51)  | (\$2,39)  | (\$2,26)  | (\$1.74)  | (under)  | ovel/       | <u> </u>            | 200    |
| 6         | 6         | o         | 6         | 6         | 0         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 6         | <b>o</b>  | 6         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 0         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 6         | 4         | 4         | 4         | 2         | 2         | _         | _         | _         | 0         | 0         | 0         | Days     | *           |                     | )      |
| \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.13    | \$1.13    | \$1.13    | \$0.55    | \$0.53    | \$0.27    | \$0.26    | \$0.25    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | Value    | Touriy      |                     |        |
| \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0,00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    |          |             | WC A                | 5      |
| \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.86    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.80    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.75    | \$1.13    | \$1.13    | \$1.13    | \$0.55    | \$0.53    | \$0.27    | \$0.26    | \$0.25    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | \$0.00    | (under)  | Over        | CCOL                | 2      |
| \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$110.81  | \$107.97  | \$107.97  | \$107.97  | \$107.97  | \$107.97  | \$103.67  | \$103.67  | \$103.67  | \$103.67  | \$103.67  | \$103,67  | \$100.37  | \$100.37  | \$100.37  | \$97.23   | \$93.41   | \$93,15   | \$90.74   | \$88.62   | \$86.09   | \$83.90   | 06.88\$   | CCSF     | -           | Salary and benefits | 2      |
| \$125.69  | \$125.69  | \$123.56  | \$123.56  | \$123.56  | \$123.56  | \$123.56  | \$121.61  | \$121.61  | \$121.61  | \$121.61  | \$121.61  | \$118.63  | \$118.63  | \$118.63  | \$118.63  | \$118.63  | \$115.67  | \$115.67  | \$115.67  | \$115.67  | \$115.67  | \$112.82  | \$112.82  | \$112.82  | \$110.96  | \$110.96  | \$110.96  | \$107.73  | \$104.62  | \$101.62  | \$98.69   | \$94.87   | MC A     |             | Sillauag            |        |
| (\$14,88) | (\$14.88) | (\$12.75) | (\$12.75) | (\$12.75) | (\$12.75) | (\$12.75) | (\$10.80) | (\$10.80) | (\$10.80) | (\$10.80) | (\$13.64) | (\$10.66) | (\$10.66) | (\$10.66) | (\$10.66) | (\$14.96) | (\$12.00) | (\$12.00) | (\$12.00) | (\$12.00) | (\$12.00) | (\$12.46) | (\$12.46) | (\$12.46) | (\$13.74) | (\$17.55) | (\$17.81) | (\$16.99) | (\$16.00) | (\$15.53) | (\$14.79) | (\$10.97) | Center A | (under) Med | Dillerence          | 7.8    |