



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

EDWIN M. LEE
MAYOR

Sent Via Electronic Mail

July 21, 2016

GINA M. ROCCANOVA
PRESIDENT

KATE FAVETTI
VICE PRESIDENT

DOUGLAS S. CHAN
COMMISSIONER

SCOTT R. HELDFOND
COMMISSIONER

MICHAEL L. BROWN
EXECUTIVE OFFICER

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

**SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS
AND FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE IN
THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a meeting to be held on **August 1, 2016 at 2:00 p.m.** in Room 400, Fourth Floor, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached Notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings. The meeting agenda and all meeting materials will be posted on the Civil Service Commission's website at www.sfgov.org/CivilService under "Meetings" no later than end of day on Wednesday, July 27, 2016. If you would like a copy of the staff report on the above-captioned matter emailed to you in advance of July 27th, please contact the Civil Service Commission's Office at CivilService@sfgov.org or (415) 252-3247.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is welcome. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting.

All non-privileged materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission for this item will be available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MICHAEL L. BROWN
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resources
Acting Chief Toney Chaplin, San Francisco Police Department
Chief Joanne Hayes-White, San Francisco Fire Department
Susan Gard, Department of Human Resources
Monica Guzman, Department of Human Resources
Jay Huish, Employee Retirement System
Martin Halloran, San Francisco Police Officers
Thomas P. O'Connor, San Francisco Firefighters, Local 798
Steven Ponder, Department of Human Resources
Raquel Silva, San Francisco Municipal Executives Association
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

1. CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER NUMBER: 0245-14-3
2. FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING OF: August 1, 2016
3. CHECK ONE: CONSENT AGENDA ☒
- REGULAR AGENDA ☐
4. SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS
AND FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE
IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
5. RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT REPORT; TRANSMIT RATES TO THE
RETIREMENT SYSTEM IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHARTER SECTION
A8.590.1-A8.590-7; PROVIDE REPORT TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.
6. REPORT PREPARED BY: Monica Guzman
TELEPHONE NUMBER: 415-557-4965
7. NOTIFICATIONS: SEE ATTACHED
8. REVIEWED AND APPROVED FOR CIVIL SERVICE AGENDA:

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR: 

DATE: 7/8/16

9. SUBMIT THE ORIGINAL TIME-STAMPED COPY OF THIS FORM AND
PERSONS TO BE NOTIFIED (SEE ITEM 7 ABOVE) ALONG WITH THE
REQUIRED COPIES OF THE REPORT TO:

EXECUTIVE OFFICER
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
25 VAN NESS, ROOM 720
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

10. RECEIPT-STAMP THIS FORM IN THE "CSC RECEIPT
STAMP" BOX TO THE RIGHT USING THE TIME-
STAMP IN THE CSC OFFICE.

ATTACHMENT

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

2016 JUL -7 PM 2:

RECEIVED
EXECUTIVE OFFICE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISS
SAN FRANCISCO

NOTIFICATIONS:

Chief Joanne Hayes-White
San Francisco Fire Department
698 2nd Street
San Francisco, CA 94107

Chief Toney Chaplin
San Francisco Police Department
850 Bryant Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Martin Halloran, President
San Francisco Police Officers
Association
510 Seventh Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Thomas P. O'Connor, President
San Francisco Firefighters, Local 798
1139 Mission Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Steven Ponder
Classification & Compensation Director
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Micki Callahan
Employee Relations Director
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Jay Huish
Executive Director
Employee Retirement System
30 Van Ness Avenue, 3rd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Monica Guzman
Classification & Compensation Analyst
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Susan Gard
Chief of Policy
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Raquel Silva
Executive Director
S.F. Municipal Executives Association
870 Market Street, Rm. 450
San Francisco, CA 94147-4146

City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee
Mayor



Department of Human Resources

Micki Callahan
Human Resources Director

DATE: July 6, 2016

TO: The Honorable Civil Service Commission

FROM: Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director *MC*

SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS AND FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA.

RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT REPORT; TRANSMIT RATES TO THE RETIREMENT SYSTEM IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHARTER SECTION A8.590-1 THROUGH A8.590-7. PROVIDE REPORT TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.

BACKGROUND AND ISSUES

In November 1990, the electorate passed Proposition D, which allows for collective bargaining to set wages and working conditions of the uniformed force of the Police and Fire Departments. Charter Sections A8.590-1 through A8.590-7 require that the rates of pay for retired Police Officers and Firefighters shall be based on rates that are not lower than the rates that would be established if Charter Section A8.405 were still in effect.

Per Section A8.405 of the Charter, the staff has surveyed rates of compensation paid to Police Officers and Firefighters in all cities of 350,000 population or more in the State of California, based on the 2010 federal decennial census. The cities used in the survey are Fresno, Long Beach, Los Angeles, Oakland, Sacramento, San Diego, and San Jose. Staff also surveyed compensation paid for police two-wheeled motorcycle duty in these same cities. The results of our survey are attached. Please note this survey reflects the Charter-mandated jurisdictions. The City uses different, regional comparator jurisdictions for salary negotiations.

THE FINDINGS

As of July 1, 2016, the average maximum monthly wage for Police Officers at the agencies in our survey is \$7,534 per month. This is \$2,095 less than the maximum monthly wage currently paid to San Francisco Police Officers. This average maximum monthly rate of \$7,534 is 27.80% below the \$9,629 maximum monthly rate for San Francisco Police Officers. The percent increase between last year's maximum monthly rate and the current average maximum monthly rate is 1.85%. The rates of pay for Police Department classes, if A8.405 were in effect, are shown in the tables following the survey results.

For Firefighters, the average maximum monthly rate at the agencies in our survey, as of July 1, 2016, is \$7,130, or \$2,501 less than the maximum monthly rate paid to San Francisco Firefighters. This average maximum monthly rate of \$7,130 is 35.08% below

the \$9,631 maximum monthly rate for San Francisco Firefighters. Since the maximum monthly rate paid to San Francisco Firefighters has long been above the average of the surveyed cities, the A8.405 rates for Firefighters are based on the increase provided to the Police classes, according to A8.405(d). The A8.405 rates of pay for Firefighter classes are shown in the tables following the survey results.

Since the Bureau of Labor Statistics changed the reporting period for the San Francisco metropolitan area Consumer Price Index from monthly to bimonthly, we can no longer report the March-to-March change as provided in the Charter. Therefore, the February CPI rates for San Francisco and the other surveyed cities are indicated in this report. The cost of living for San Francisco increased by 2.94% and the average increase in cost of living for the other cities surveyed was 2.47% during this period. There is a 0.47% difference between the cost of living increase for San Francisco and the cost of living for the cities surveyed.

Section 4 E of the 2007-2018 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the San Francisco Police Officers' Association provides that "members assigned to the Motorcycle and Honda units shall continue to receive a premium in an amount in accord with current practice pursuant to Charter Section A8.405(b)." The survey results show the average monthly Motorcycle Pay for two-wheel motorcycle traffic duty at the other agencies is \$445 per month. The comparable current rate for San Francisco Police Officers is \$430 per month.

In conclusion, the collectively bargained monthly rates for the Police Officers and Firefighters exceed the average maximum monthly rates as defined by Charter Section A8.405.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Civil Service Commission approve and transmit to the Retirement System and to the Board of Supervisors this survey of rates certified in the attached report in accordance with Charter Sections A8.405 and A8.590-1 through A8.590-7.

Respectfully Submitted,



Steven Ponder
Classification and
Compensation Director

**City and County of San Francisco
POLICE OFFICER SALARY SURVEY**

Rates of Pay Effective July 1, 2016

City	Class Title	MC Pay*	Number of Positions	Monthly Salary	
				Minimum	Maximum
San Francisco	Police Officer	\$430	1,786	\$6,918	\$9,629
Fresno	Police Officer	\$275	553	\$5,175	\$6,607
Long Beach	Police Officer	\$366	648	\$5,903	\$7,310
Los Angeles	Police Officer	\$884	4,819	\$5,625	\$7,663
Oakland	Police Officer	\$453	607	\$6,474	\$9,066
Sacramento	Police Officer	---	611	\$5,258	\$6,391
San Diego	Police Officer II	\$222	1,328	\$5,254	\$6,350
San Jose ¹	Police Officer	\$468	870	\$6,985	\$9,354
Average of Other Cities		\$445		\$5,811	\$7,534

* Two-Wheeled Motorcycle Pay

San Francisco maximum rate exceeds the Average of Other Cities by:	27.80%
--	--------

Number of Positions in San Francisco from HRMS as of June 21, 2016

**City and County of San Francisco
FIREFIGHTER SALARY SURVEY**

Rates of Pay Effective July 1, 2016

City	Class Title	Number of Positions	Monthly Salary	
			Minimum	Maximum
San Francisco	Firefighter	847	\$6,240	\$9,631
Fresno	Firefighter	86	\$4,916	\$6,278
Long Beach	Firefighter	180	\$5,438	\$6,678
Los Angeles	Firefighter	1,860	\$5,919	\$7,369
Oakland	Firefighter	168	\$7,500	\$9,196
Sacramento	Firefighter	363	\$5,115	\$6,217
San Diego	Firefighter II	247	\$4,392	\$5,300
San Jose	Fire Engineer	224	\$7,299	\$8,871
Average of Other Cities:			\$5,797	\$7,130
San Francisco maximum rate exceeds Average of Other Cities by:				35.08%

Number of Positions in San Francisco from HRMS as of June 21, 2016

CONSUMER PRICE INDEX
Urban Wage Earners and Clerical Workers (CPI-W)

City	February 2015*	February 2016*	Percent Increase	
San Francisco	249.8	257.1	2.94%	
Long Beach	233.0	238.3	2.22%	
Los Angeles	233.0	238.3	2.22%	
Oakland	249.8	257.1	2.94%	
**San Diego	249.9	255.1	2.05%	
San Jose	249.8	257.1	2.94%	
The average cost of living in all other cities increased by:				2.47%
The cost of living in San Francisco increased by:				2.94%

Note:

The Bureau of Labor Statistics does not compile cost-of-living indexes for Sacramento and Fresno.

* The reporting period for the San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose metropolitan area changed several years ago from monthly to bi-monthly. The rates shown reflect the CPI in February of each year. To maintain consistency, the February CPI rates are indicated for Los Angeles and Long Beach.

** The Bureau of Labor Statistics publishes only a semi-annual rate for San Diego. As such, the CPI data listed for San Diego is the 2nd half of 2014 and the 2nd half of 2015 using Urban Wage Earners and Clerical Workers (CPI-W).

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Police Classes

Effective Date Percent increase		July 1, 2016	
		1.85%	
		Biweekly	Monthly
0390	Chief of Police	\$9,312	\$20,254
0395	Assistant Chief	\$8,268	\$17,982
0380	Inspector	\$4,017	\$8,737
0381	Inspector II	\$4,176	\$9,082
0382	Inspector III	\$4,259	\$9,263
0400	Deputy Chief	\$7,839	\$17,049
0401	Deputy Chief II	\$8,151	\$17,728
0402	Deputy Chief III	\$8,309	\$18,073
0488	Commander	\$6,371	\$13,858
0489	Commander II	\$6,626	\$14,411
0490	Commander III	\$6,754	\$14,689
Q 35	Assistant Inspector	\$3,712	\$8,074
Q 35	Assistant Inspector (with 2 years svc)	\$4,017	\$8,737
Q 36	Assistant Inspector II	\$3,860	\$8,395
Q 36	Assistant Inspector II (with 2 years svc)	\$4,176	\$9,082
Q 37	Assistant Inspector III	\$3,937	\$8,562
Q 37	Assistant Inspector III (with 2 years svc)	\$4,259	\$9,263
Q 50	Sergeant	\$4,017	\$8,737
Q 51	Sergeant II	\$4,176	\$9,082
Q 52	Sergeant III	\$4,259	\$9,263
Q 60	Lieutenant	\$4,587	\$9,976
Q 61	Lieutenant II	\$4,772	\$10,379
Q 62	Lieutenant III	\$4,863	\$10,576
Q 63	Criminologist	\$5,388	\$11,719
Q 80	Captain	\$5,388	\$11,719
Q 81	Captain II	\$5,602	\$12,184
Q 82	Captain III	\$5,713	\$12,425
Q 90	Dir, Police Psych	\$5,630	\$12,246
Q 2	Police Officer	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		---	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$2,638	\$5,737
		\$2,994	\$6,513
		\$3,141	\$6,831
		\$3,297	\$7,170
		\$3,464	\$7,534
Q 3	Police Officer II	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		-	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$2,743	\$5,967
		\$3,112	\$6,769
		\$3,266	\$7,104
		\$3,428	\$7,455
		\$3,601	\$7,833
Q 4	Police Officer III	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		---	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$2,796	\$6,081
		\$3,171	\$6,896
		\$3,331	\$7,245
		\$3,493	\$7,598
		\$3,671	\$7,985

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Fire Classes

Effective Date		July 1, 2016	
Percent increase		1.85%	
		Biweekly	Monthly
0140	Chief of Department	\$9,312	\$20,254
0150	Deputy Chief of Department	\$7,839	\$17,049
H 51	Assistant Deputy Chief II	\$6,373	\$13,861
H 53	Emergency Medical Services Chief	\$6,373	\$13,861
H 4	Inspector, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$4,142	\$9,009
H 6	Investigator, Bureau of Fire Investigation	\$4,142	\$9,009
H 10	Chief's Operator	\$3,770	\$8,199
H 16	Technical Training Specialist	\$4,014	\$8,730
H 18	Coordinator of Community Service	\$4,014	\$8,730
H 19	Operations-Training Supervisor, Airport	\$4,014	\$8,730
H 20	Lieutenant	\$4,018	\$8,740
H 22	Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$4,538	\$9,871
H 24	Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Investigation	\$4,538	\$9,871
H 28	Lieutenant, Division of Training	\$4,587	\$9,976
H 30	Captain	\$4,588	\$9,978
H 32	Captain, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$5,188	\$11,284
H 33	EMS Captain	\$4,588	\$9,978
H 39	Captain, Division of Training	\$5,509	\$11,983
H 40	Battalion Chief	\$5,511	\$11,987
H 43	EMS Section Chief	\$5,511	\$11,987
H 50	Assistant Chief of Department	\$6,371	\$13,858
H110	Marine Engineer of Fire Boats	\$4,587	\$9,976
H120	Pilot of Fire Boats	\$4,587	\$9,976
H 2	Firefighter	Pre- 7/1/96 to	
		<u>7/1/1996</u> <u>present</u>	
		-- 1st year	\$2,638 \$5,737
		1st year 2nd year	\$2,994 \$6,513
		2nd year 3rd year	\$3,141 \$6,831
		3rd year 4th year	\$3,297 \$7,170
		4th year 5th year	\$3,464 \$7,534
H 3	Firefighter/Paramedic	\$4,001	\$8,703

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Abolished Police and Fire Classes

Effective Date	July 1, 2016	
Percent increase	1.85%	
	Biweekly	Monthly

Police Department

0360	Chief of Inspectors			\$7,839	\$17,049
0420	Department Secretary			\$6,371	\$13,858
0460	Secretary, Police Commission			\$4,587	\$9,976
0470	Supervising Captain			\$6,371	\$13,858
0480	Director of Traffic			\$7,839	\$17,049
0485	Supervising Captain of Patrol			\$6,371	\$13,858
0490	Captain of Traffic			\$5,789	\$12,591
0520	Police Surgeon			\$3,464	\$7,534
Q20	Police Woman	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>		
		--	1st year	\$2,638	\$5,737
		1st year	2nd year	\$2,994	\$6,513
		2nd year	3rd year	\$3,141	\$6,831
		3rd year	4th year	\$3,297	\$7,170
		4th year	5th year	\$3,464	\$7,534

Fire Department

0145	Assistant Deputy Chief	\$7,838	\$17,047
0155	Secretary to the Chief of Department	\$6,167	\$13,414
H 17	Medical Coordinator	\$4,014	\$8,730
H 19	Operations-Training Supervisor, Airport	\$4,014	\$8,730
H 29	Special Svcs. Officer	\$4,587	\$9,976