



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

Sent via Electronic Mail

July 25, 2018

ELIZABETH SALVESON
PRESIDENT

KATE FAVETTI
VICE PRESIDENT

DOUGLAS S. CHAN
COMMISSIONER

F. X. CROWLEY
COMMISSIONER

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS AND FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA (FY 19-20).

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a meeting to be held on **August 5, 2019 at 2:00 p.m. in Room 400**, Fourth Floor, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place.

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached Notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings. The meeting agenda and all meeting materials will be posted on the Civil Service Commission's website at www.sfgov.org/CivilService under "Meetings" no later than end of day on Wednesday, July 31, 2019. If you would like a copy of the staff report on the above-captioned matter emailed to you in advance of July 31st, please contact the Civil Service Commission's Office at CivilService@sfgov.org or (415) 252-3247.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is welcome. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting.

All non-privileged materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission for this item will be available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

MICHAEL L. BROWN
EXECUTIVE OFFICER

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MICHAEL L. BROWN
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resources
Chief William Scott, San Francisco Police Department
Chief Jeanine Nicholson, San Francisco Fire Department
Susan Gard, Department of Human Resources
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Andrew Kukis, Department of Human Resources
Jay Huish, Employee Retirement System
Tony Montoya, San Francisco Police Officers
Shon Buford, San Francisco Firefighters, Local 798
Steven Ponder, Department of Human Resources
Raquel Silva, San Francisco Municipal Executives Association
Darlene Armanino, Employee Retirement System
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

1. CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REGISTER NUMBER: 0185-19-3
2. FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING OF: _____
3. CHECK ONE: CONSENT AGENDA
REGULAR AGENDA
4. SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS AND FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA (FY19-20)
5. RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT REPORT; TRANSMIT RATES TO THE RETIREMENT SYSTEM IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHARTER SECTION A8.590.1-A8.590-7; PROVIDE REPORT TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.
6. REPORT PREPARED BY: Andrew Kukis
TELEPHONE NUMBER: 415-557-4833
7. NOTIFICATIONS: SEE ATTACHED
8. REVIEWED AND APPROVED FOR CIVIL SERVICE AGENDA:

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR: 

DATE: 7/8/19

9. SUBMIT THE ORIGINAL TIME-STAMPED COPY OF THIS FORM AND PERSONS TO BE NOTIFIED (SEE ITEM 7 ABOVE) ALONG WITH THE REQUIRED COPIES OF THE REPORT TO:

EXECUTIVE OFFICER
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
25 VAN NESS, ROOM 720
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

10. RECEIPT-STAMP THIS FORM IN THE "CSC RECEIPT STAMP" BOX TO THE RIGHT USING THE TIME-STAMP IN THE CSC OFFICE.

ATTACHMENT

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

2019 JUL 10 PM 2:15
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
SAN FRANCISCO

NOTIFICATIONS:

Chief Jeanine Nicholson
San Francisco Fire Department
698 2nd Street
San Francisco, CA 94107

Chief William Scott
San Francisco Police Department
850 Bryant Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Tony Montoya, President
San Francisco Police Officers
Association
800 Bryant Street, 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Shon Buford, President
San Francisco Firefighters, Local 798
1139 Mission Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Steven Ponder
Classification & Compensation Director
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Carol Isen
Employee Relations Director
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Jay Huish
Executive Director
Employee Retirement System
1145 Market Street, 5th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Darlene Armanino
Executive Assistant to Jay Huish
Employee Retirement System
1145 Market Street, 5th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Susan Gard
Chief of Policy
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Raquel Silva
Executive Director
S.F. Municipal Executives Association
870 Market Street, Rm. 450
San Francisco, CA 94147-4146

Andrew Kukis
Classification & Compensation Analyst
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

City and County of San Francisco
Micki Callahan
Human Resources Director



Department of Human Resources
Connecting People with Purpose
www.sfdhr.org

DATE: July 3, 2019
TO: The Honorable Civil Service Commission
FROM: Micki Callahan,
Human Resources Director
SUBJECT: SURVEY OF MONTHLY RATES PAID TO POLICE OFFICERS AND
FIREFIGHTERS IN ALL CITIES OF 350,000 OR MORE IN THE STATE OF
CALIFORNIA (FY19-20).
RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT REPORT; TRANSMIT RATES TO THE RETIREMENT SYSTEM IN
ACCORDANCE WITH CHARTER SECTION A8.590-1 THROUGH A8.590-7.
PROVIDE REPORT TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

BACKGROUND AND ISSUES

In November 1990, the electorate passed Proposition D, which allows for collective bargaining to set wages and working conditions of the uniformed force of the Police and Fire Departments. Charter Sections A8.590-1 through A8.590-7 requires that the rates of pay for retired Police Officers and Firefighters shall be based on rates that are not lower than the rates that would be established if Charter Section A8.405 were still in effect.

Per Section A8.405 of the Charter, the staff has surveyed rates of compensation paid to Police Officers and Firefighters in all cities of 350,000 population or more in the State of California, based on the 2010 federal decennial census. The cities used in the survey are Fresno, Long Beach, Los Angeles, Oakland, Sacramento, San Diego, and San Jose. Staff also surveyed compensation paid for police two-wheeled motorcycle duty in these same cities. The results of our survey are attached. Please note this survey reflects the Charter-mandated jurisdictions. The City uses different, regional comparator jurisdictions for salary negotiations.

THE FINDINGS

As of July 1, 2019, the average maximum monthly wage for Police Officers at the agencies in our survey is \$8,655 per month. This is \$1,764 less than the maximum monthly wage currently paid to San Francisco Police Officers. This average maximum monthly rate of \$8,655 is 20.38% below the \$10,420 maximum monthly rate for San Francisco Police Officers. The percent increase between last year's average maximum monthly rate and the current average maximum monthly rate is 5.00%. The rates of pay for Police Department classes, if A8.405 were in effect, are shown in the tables following the survey results.

For Firefighters, the average maximum monthly rate at the agencies in our survey, as of July 1, 2019, is \$7,946, or \$2,476 less than the maximum monthly rate paid to San Francisco Firefighters. This average maximum monthly rate of \$7,946 is 31.16% below the \$10,422 maximum monthly rate for San Francisco Firefighters. The rates of pay for Firefighter classes, if A8.405 were in effect, are shown in the tables following the survey results.

Since the Bureau of Labor Statistics changed the reporting period for the San Francisco metropolitan area Consumer Price Index from monthly to bimonthly, we can no longer report the March-to-March change as provided in the Charter. Therefore, the February CPI rates for San Francisco and the other surveyed cities are indicated in this report. The cost of living for San Francisco increased by 3.29% and the average increase in cost of living for the other cities surveyed was 2.80% during this period. There is a 0.49% difference between the cost of living increase for San Francisco and the cost of living for the cities surveyed.

Section 4 E of the 2018-2021 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the San Francisco Police Officers' Association provides that "employees below the rank of captain assigned to Motorcycle and Honda units shall continue to receive a premium in an amount in accord with current practice pursuant to Charter Section A8.405(b)." The survey results show the average monthly Motorcycle Pay for two-wheel motorcycle traffic duty at the other agencies is \$493 per month. The comparable current rate for San Francisco Police Officers is \$474 per month.

In conclusion, the collectively bargained monthly rates for the Police Officers and Firefighters exceed the average maximum monthly rates as defined by Charter Section A8.405.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Civil Service Commission approve and transmit to the Retirement System and to the Board of Supervisors this survey of rates certified in the attached report in accordance with Charter Sections A8.405 and A8.590-1 through A8.590-7.

Respectfully Submitted,



Steven Ponder
Classification and Compensation Director

**City and County of San Francisco
POLICE OFFICER SALARY SURVEY**

Rates of Pay Effective July 1, 2019

City	Class Title	MC Pay*	Number of Positions	Monthly Salary	
				Minimum	Maximum
San Francisco	Police Officer	\$474	1,695	\$7,488	\$10,420
Fresno	Police Officer	\$275	664	\$5,438	\$7,290
Long Beach	Police Officer	\$418	692	\$6,450	\$8,387
Los Angeles	Police Officer II	\$936	4,801	\$5,970	\$8,133
Oakland	Police Officer	\$515	592	\$7,360	\$10,307
Sacramento	Police Officer	---	609	\$5,804	\$7,778
San Diego	Police Officer II	\$271	949	\$6,413	\$7,748
San Jose	Police Officer	\$545	905	\$8,171	\$10,944
Average of Other Cities		\$493		\$6,515	\$8,655

* Two-Wheeled Motorcycle Pay

San Francisco maximum rate exceeds the Average of Other Cities by:	20.38%
--	--------

Number of Positions in San Francisco from HRMS as of June 7, 2019

**City and County of San Francisco
FIREFIGHTER SALARY SURVEY**

Rates of Pay Effective July 1, 2019

City	Class Title	Number of Positions	Monthly Salary	
			Minimum	Maximum
San Francisco	Firefighter	873	\$6,754	\$10,422
Fresno	Firefighter	115	\$5,753	\$6,998
Long Beach	Firefighter	201	\$5,942	\$7,297
Los Angeles	Firefighter III	1,928	\$6,534	\$8,133
Oakland	Firefighter	164	\$7,342	\$9,662
Sacramento	Firefighter	369	\$5,532	\$6,724
San Diego	Firefighter II	315	\$4,686	\$5,656
San Jose	Fire Engineer	233	\$9,220	\$11,149
Average of Other Cities:			\$6,430	\$7,946
San Francisco maximum rate exceeds Average of Other Cities by:				31.16%

Number of Positions in San Francisco from HRMS as of June 7, 2019

CONSUMER PRICE INDEX
Urban Wage Earners and Clerical Workers (CPI-W)

City	February 2018*	February 2019*	Percent Increase
San Francisco	275.7	284.8	3.29%
Long Beach	253.2	259.7	2.56%
Los Angeles	253.2	259.7	2.56%
Oakland	275.7	284.8	3.29%
**San Diego	272.8	279.1	2.30%
San Jose	275.7	284.8	3.29%
The average cost of living in all other cities increased by:			2.80%
The cost of living in San Francisco increased by:			3.29%

Note:

The Bureau of Labor Statistics does not compile cost-of-living indexes for Sacramento and Fresno.

* The reporting period for the San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose metropolitan area changed several years ago from monthly to bi-monthly. The rates shown reflect the CPI in February of each year. To maintain consistency, the February CPI rates are indicated for Los Angeles and Long Beach.

** The reporting period for the San Diego-Carlsbad metropolitan area changed in November 2017 from semi-annually to bi-monthly. The rates shown reflect the CPI in March of each year because the Bureau of Labor Statistics publishes CPI for the San Diego-Carlsbad metropolitan area on opposite months as that for the San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose metropolitan area.

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Police Classes

Effective Date	Percent Increase	July 1, 2019	
		5.00%	
		Biweekly	Monthly
0390	Chief of Police	\$10,698	\$23,268
0395	Assistant Chief	\$9,498	\$20,658
0380	Inspector	\$4,615	\$10,038
0381	Inspector II	\$4,797	\$10,434
0382	Inspector III	\$4,893	\$10,642
0400	Deputy Chief	\$9,005	\$19,586
0401	Deputy Chief II	\$9,364	\$20,366
0402	Deputy Chief III	\$9,546	\$20,762
0488	Commander	\$7,320	\$15,920
0489	Commander II	\$7,612	\$16,556
0490	Commander III	\$7,759	\$16,876
Q 35	Assistant Inspector	\$4,264	\$9,275
Q 35	Assistant Inspector (with 2 years svc)	\$4,615	\$10,038
Q 36	Assistant Inspector II	\$4,434	\$9,645
Q 36	Assistant Inspector II (with 2 years svc)	\$4,797	\$10,434
Q 37	Assistant Inspector III	\$4,522	\$9,836
Q 37	Assistant Inspector III (with 2 years svc)	\$4,893	\$10,642
Q 50	Sergeant	\$4,615	\$10,038
Q 51	Sergeant II	\$4,797	\$10,434
Q 52	Sergeant III	\$4,893	\$10,642
Q 60	Lieutenant	\$5,269	\$11,461
Q 61	Lieutenant II	\$5,482	\$11,924
Q 62	Lieutenant III	\$5,586	\$12,150
Q 63	Criminologist	\$6,189	\$13,462
Q 80	Captain	\$6,189	\$13,462
Q 81	Captain II	\$6,436	\$13,998
Q 82	Captain III	\$6,563	\$14,274
Q 2	Police Officer	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		--	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$3,030	\$6,591
		\$3,440	\$7,482
		\$3,608	\$7,848
		\$3,787	\$8,237
		\$3,979	\$8,655
Q 3	Police Officer II	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		--	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$3,152	\$6,855
		\$3,575	\$7,776
		\$3,753	\$8,162
		\$3,937	\$8,564
		\$4,137	\$8,999
Q 4	Police Officer III	Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		--	1st year
		1st year	2nd year
		2nd year	3rd year
		3rd year	4th year
		4th year	5th year
		\$3,212	\$6,986
		\$3,642	\$7,922
		\$3,827	\$8,323
		\$4,014	\$8,730
		\$4,218	\$9,174

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Fire Classes

Effective Date	Percent increase	July 1, 2019	
		5.00%	
		Biweekly	Monthly
0140	Chief of Department	\$10,698	\$23,268
0150	Deputy Chief of Department	\$9,005	\$19,586
H 51	Assistant Deputy Chief II	\$7,321	\$15,923
H 53	Emergency Medical Services Chief	\$7,321	\$15,923
H 4	Inspector, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$4,758	\$10,349
H 6	Investigator, Bureau of Fire Investigation	\$4,758	\$10,349
H 10	Chief's Operator	\$4,331	\$9,420
H 16	Technical Training Specialist	\$4,611	\$10,029
H 18	Coordinator of Community Service	\$4,611	\$10,029
H 20	Lieutenant	\$4,617	\$10,041
H 22	Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$5,214	\$11,340
H 23	Lieutenant, Emergency Medical Services	\$4,617	\$10,041
H 24	Lieutenant, Bureau of Fire Investigation	\$5,214	\$11,340
H 28	Lieutenant, Division of Training	\$5,269	\$11,461
H 30	Captain	\$5,270	\$11,463
H 32	Captain, Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety	\$5,960	\$12,963
H 33	EMS Captain	\$5,270	\$11,463
H 39	Captain, Division of Training	\$6,330	\$13,767
H 40	Battalion Chief	\$6,331	\$13,771
H 42	Assistant Fire Marshall	\$6,331	\$13,771
H 43	EMS Section Chief	\$6,331	\$13,771
H 50	Assistant Chief of Department	\$7,320	\$15,920
H110	Marine Engineer of Fire Boats	\$5,269	\$11,461
H120	Pilot of Fire Boats	\$5,269	\$11,461
H 2	Firefighter		
		Pre- <u>7/1/1996</u>	7/1/96 to <u>present</u>
		--	1st year
		\$3,030	\$6,591
		1st year	2nd year
		\$3,440	\$7,482
		2nd year	3rd year
		\$3,608	\$7,848
		3rd year	4th year
		\$3,787	\$8,237
		4th year	5th year
		\$3,979	\$8,655
H 3	Firefighter/Paramedic	\$4,597	\$9,998

A8.405 Rates of Pay for Abolished Police and Fire Classes

Effective Date	July 1, 2019	
Percent increase	5.00%	
	Biweekly	Monthly
Police Department		
0360 Chief of Inspectors	\$9,005	\$19,586
0420 Department Secretary	\$7,320	\$15,920
0460 Secretary, Police Commission	\$5,269	\$11,461
0470 Supervising Captain	\$7,320	\$15,920
0480 Director of Traffic	\$9,005	\$19,586
0485 Supervising Captain of Patrol	\$7,320	\$15,920
0490 Captain of Traffic	\$6,651	\$14,465
0520 Police Surgeon	\$3,979	\$8,655
Q20 Police Woman		
	Pre- 7/1/96 to	
	<u>7/1/1996</u> <u>present</u>	
	-- 1st year	\$6,591
	1st year 2nd year	\$7,482
	2nd year 3rd year	\$7,848
	3rd year 4th year	\$8,237
	4th year 5th year	\$8,655
Q 90 Dir, Police Psych	\$6,160	\$13,399
Fire Department		
0145 Assistant Deputy Chief	\$9,004	\$19,584
0155 Secretary to the Chief of Department	\$7,086	\$15,411
H 17 Medical Coordinator	\$4,611	\$10,029
H 19 Operations-Training Supervisor, Airport	\$4,611	\$10,029
H 29 Special Svcs. Officer	\$5,269	\$11,461