



# **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

## **MINUTES**

**Regular Meeting  
June 15, 2020**

**2:00 p.m.**

**Meeting held by teleconference pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20 and the Eighth Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (408) 418-9388 | Access Code: 1462577030**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**DOUGLAS CHAN**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

During the Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) emergency, the Civil Service Commission's regular meeting room, City Hall, Room 400 is closed. Commissioners and Civil Service Commission staff will convene remotely. The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting in one of two ways: (1) email [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or record a message on the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-408-418-9388, Access Code 146 257 7030. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:52 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Elizabeth Salveson	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Elizabeth Salveson presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No.2)**

**Saraswati Rathod**, my name is Saraswati Rathod; I'm a resident of San Francisco, and I'm writing to urge you to publicly announce that the Civil Service Commission will prohibit the San Francisco Police Department and San Francisco Sheriff's Department from hiring officers with a known history of serious police misconduct. The extrajudicial murder of George Floyd on May 25 by a Minneapolis Police Department Officer once again highlighted the urgent need for greater accountability for police officers with a history of misconduct. The officer who was charged for Mr. Floyd's murder had faced at least 17 prior complaints during his time on the force. He had also been involved in a number of officer-involved shootings. Despite these complaints of police brutality, violent incidents, and at least one reprimand, Chauvin was allowed to remain on the police force. That lack of accountability for Chauvin ultimately led to the death of George Floyd. Meanwhile, [research over the last decade has shown](#) that officers with a history of misconduct and excessive force complaints are more likely to shoot civilians and engage in serious misconduct in the future. The Civil Service Commission cannot allow officers with a demonstrated record of misconduct the opportunity to brutalize our city's citizens and abuse their positions of power while serving as officers of the law. I am urging the Civil Service Commission to require the disqualification of any police officer or sheriff's deputy applicant with a sustained finding of serious misconduct, such as excessive force; racial bias; discrimination based on race, national origin, gender, or sexual orientation; or dishonesty related to the reporting, investigation, or prosecution of a crime, or misconduct of another officer. I am also asking that the Commission disqualify any officer who leaves a law enforcement job during the course of a serious misconduct investigation, unless the officer has been exonerated. Thank you for your time.

**Continued  
Item 2**

**Maya Perelman**, As I watch scenes of police brutality unfold nationwide -- including here in SF -- I am heartbroken and enraged. I urge you to promptly enact the rules proposed by the Board of Supervisors and District DA today. This is an important step in creating greater accountability and transparency in the hiring of law enforcement personnel, and to preventing the kind of horrific violence we saw in the death of George Floyd.

**Edna Kozikaro**, my name is Edna. I am a resident of San Francisco and I am emailing you today to urge you to set a policy prohibiting the Police and Sheriff’s Departments from hiring law enforcement personnel with histories of serious misconduct. Anyone who has several complaints of incidents like excessive force or racial profiling in their record has no place serving our community. Officers from other jurisdictions who have left their previous job to avoid disciplinary action for serious conduct have no place serving our community. Hiring policy must be approached with an anti-racist lens.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of June 1, 2020

**Action:** Adopted the minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer gave thanks to everyone for their patience in getting connected to today’s meeting.

**COMMENDATIONS AGENDA**

**0141-20-1** **Commendation for Louis A. Voccia, Human Resources Manager, Office of the Controller, for his dedicated service to the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 5)**

**Speaker:** Louis A. Voccia, Office of the Controller

**Public Comments:** Luenna Kim, Human Service Agency  
Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resource  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission

**Action:** Accepted the Commendation. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0142-20-1 Commendation for Princess Campbell, Merit Manager, Department of Public Health, for her dedicated service to the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 6)**

**Speaker:** Princess Campbell, Department of Public Health

**Public Comments:** Micki Callahan, Department of Human Resources  
Michael Brown, Department of Public Health

**Action:** Accepted the Commendation. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 7)**

Micki Callahan, Human Resources Director, stated that her report would be primarily focused on two (2) areas relating to racial equity. First, the City's response to the murders of George Floyd and others which has resulted in a nationwide conversation, long overdue. Protests regarding police brutality, City employees are struggling to deal with how to respond and how to continue the daily work when such momentous things are happening and we have such wrongs that need to be righted. Our new Director of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Jacqueline Joseph-Veal "JJV" has been reaching out to departments to find out what they are doing and the best practices of ways to provide support to employees. We want to provide a toolkit for employees, whether they want education, a forum or any other kind of support. She also reported on President Salveson's request from the last meeting, a report on the methods the City is using to hire Police and Sheriff, who are going to be the best qualified candidates. DHR has been in conversations with the Sheriff's and Police Departments to determine what parts each department will report on. She's also spoken with the Chief of Police and Sheriff Miyamoto, they are on full support and will be looking forward to reporting to the Commission on what we are all doing and what has been done. Anna Biasbas, Director on Selection & Hiring Resources is here to speak.

Anna Biasbas, reported that she has been working closely with Dave Johnson, Public Safety Exams Manager. They reached out to Police and Sheriff personally and gave them an outline of what each department needs to provide so everything is covered in regards to the hiring and promotional process, training due to incidents or just trainings in general. The areas that will be covered will be the areas measured through the exam process including backgrounds. The general target is to get everything including supporting documentation, trainings, and initial information from both Police and Sheriff by early July. If the Commission wants a full report they would target for a meeting in August. She also is working with Dave Johnson and with NTN and Ergometrics who administer some of the exams and are pulling the data from there as well.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT**

**Proposed Updated Fiscal Years 2020-22 Budget Request. (Item No. 8)**

**Action:** Accepted the report; Directed the Executive Officer to: continue to negotiate with the Office of the Mayor and the Controller to ensure that the Commission’s budget sufficiently supports anticipated service and staff to continue its Charter mandated functions. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0075-20-1 Mid-Year Report FY 2019-20. (Item No. 9)**

**March 16, 2020:** Postponed to a future meeting date.

**Note:** Commissioner Salveson requested an updated status on the pending appeals since the Shelter Order in place. She also requested for the department to include the Sheriff and Police Department audit and related issues in the Goals and Objectives for Fiscal Year 2020-21.

Commissioner Favetti requested the Executive Officer to begin scheduling the appeals and requested an update on the status of the older appeals (0136-17-7, 0298-18-2, 0010-15-7, and 0092-19-7).

Commissioner Minor requested the Executive Officer to include a third column in the Goals and Objectives for the Mid-Year Report to explain why certain timelines and requirements would not be achievable, especially due to the general disruption caused by the Shelter-in-Place.

**Action:** Accepted the Report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0131-20-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 10)**

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45530-19/20	City Administrator	\$500,000	Scope of work includes a technician troubleshoot/evaluate if a Variable Frequency Drive (VFD or Motor Control) can be repaired and will be fixed onsite for air handling equipment at San Francisco International Airport (SFO). If a new VFD is installed, the service is to start-up and commission to ensure the parameters of the VFD is used on an electro-mechanical drive system to control motor speeds and torque. It is also used on air handling units which regulates and circulates air as part of a ventilating, and air-conditioning system and provides air in the terminals, jet bridges, and cooling towers. Work is done on an as-needed basis.	Regular	5/31/2025

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42402-19/20	Airport	\$300,000	The San Francisco International Airport (“Airport”) required specialized maintenance, support, monitoring and software services for the proprietary aircraft gate parking guidance system – Advanced Visual Docking Guidance Systems (A-VDGS), which is operated and maintained by the Airport. The contractor intermittently provides software updates, and scheduled maintenance and calibration of the hardware.	Regular	6/30/2026
49783-19/20	Public Utilities Commission	\$105,000,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) intends to award a \$105 million (\$5 million design and \$100 million construction) Design Build (DB) agreement to support SFPUC civil, structural, electrical, process, mechanical engineering staff, and for other specialized engineering services, such as grit removal, membrane bioreactor (MBR), wetland, solids handling, disinfection, and odor control, needed to assist in the execution and delivery of SFPUC’s new Treasure Island (TI) Wastewater Treatment Plant (WWTP) and Recycled Water Facility (RWF). The \$5,000,000 design portion of the DB procurement will complete the detailed design utilizing the bridging documents (~15 to 35% level) provided in the RFP. The duration of the design portion is approximately 6 to 12 months.	Regular	7/30/2026
45983-19/20	Public Works	\$400,000	Consultants will perform highly specialized Architectural Photography Services, such as staging, lighting, photographing, post processing, and presenting buildings and architectural elements using specialized cameras, equipment, and techniques to support Public Works design staff on an as-needed basis.	Regular	12/31/2026
4011-11/12	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$6,300,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$8,300,000	Create SFO’s strategic communications plan to ensure internal and external communications capabilities at leveraging the latest technologies including mobile device applications (Apps), social media, and social networking. To ensure SFO is compliant with all governmental regulations pertaining to communications issues including but not limited to section 508 of the Rehabilitation Act (29U.S.C. §794 d) (at <a href="http://www.section508.gov/">http://www.section508.gov/</a> ) as amended by the Workforce Investment Act of 1998 (P.L. 105-220), Aug 7, 1998. To ensure SFO is competitive with other airports in terms of web, web content management, social media capability and effectiveness, and community outreach.	Modification	12/31/2022
4133-08/09	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$2,300,000 Increase Amount Requested \$3,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$5,300,000	Provide an on-site, comprehensive dental service program for the residents of Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH). The dental services shall meet or exceed the standards of the State of California Medi-Cal Denti-Cal Program. The services will include, at a minimum: routine treatment and examinations, radiographs, cleanings and fillings, relinings and repairs of dentures, fabrication of new full and partial dentures, extractions and bedside care to patients unable to come to the LHH Dental Clinic.	Modification	6/30/2024

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45859-17/18	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$,28000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$28,000,000	Public Health Primary Care connects with community based organizations and the University of California at San Francisco (UCSF) to better serve patients and clients who may not have access to Public Health Primary Care Clinic sites or who need additional care coordination or support services in order to connect them with primary care, and to implement short-term project-based work. Contractors will provide public health services integrated with primary care services, including: primary medical care, psychosocial support, peer navigation, care coordination, mental health counseling, dental care, medical case management, non-medical case management, home health care, medical nutrition therapy, health education, transitional services, outreach services, and referrals for health care and supportive services, as well as grant writing, quality improvement support, and technical consulting.	Modification	6/30/2022

**Speakers:** Joan Lubamersky, City Administrator spoke on PSC #45530-19/20. Bill Irwin and Greg Lyman, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #43911-19/20. Bill Irwin and Mary Tienken, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #45315-19/20. Bill Irwin, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #48107-19/20.

- Action:**
1. Approved PSC #45530-19/20 with the condition the City Administrator correct the record to reflect that the unions were notified. (Vote of 5 to 0)
  2. Approved PSC #43911-19/20. (Vote of 5 to 0)
  3. Approved PSC #45315-19/20 with the condition the Public Utilities Commission follow-up with information regarding the funding source and report back the progress in four (4) years by June 30, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)
  4. Approved PSC #48107-19/20 with the condition the Public Utilities Commission expand the scope of work performed, report back in four (4) years by June 30, 2024 and correct the union notifications. (Vote of 5 to 0)
  5. Adopted the report and approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote 5 to 0)

**0063-20-1 Bi-Annual Summary of Appealed Future Employment Restrictions Placed by the SFMTA. (Item No. 11)**

**March 16, 2020:** Postponed to a future meeting.

**Action:** Adopted the staff report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 12)**

Commissioner Favetti is requesting changes to the Annual Calendar, 1) Review the reports we require and 2) Define the reasons for the reports that we do require, look at the timeliness for those reports and specifically for the report on the Release of Probationary Period and Future Employability to included statistics rather than an itemized report.

Commissioner Salveson is requesting the Goals and Objectives and Strategic Planning be calendared in the near future. Also, for Commissioner Minors concerns regarding the Mid-Year Report be addressed.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 13)**

4:43 p.m.