

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, December 19, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:36 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Shelley Caltagirone, Desiree Smith, Rebecca Salgado, Shannon Ferguson, Pilar LaValley, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jeff Joslin, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

None
2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Good afternoon Commissioners. Tim Frye, department staff. A few items to share with you for our final hearing of the year. I wasn't able to give you an update on the pending Mills Act contracts at your last hearing, but I wanted to let you know and reassure you that all Mills Act contracts proposed for this cycle were approved by the Board of Supervisors and I believe they have all been recorded with the Assessor's Office. And that happened at the Board of Supervisors' hearing in mid-November. I also wanted to make you aware that there are several pending Landmark Designations at the Board of Supervisors. And given that the committees will not have adjourned for the remainder of the year, these items will likely be picked up early 2019. One is the Paper Doll in the North Beach neighborhood. It needs a board introduction. Second is 22 Beaver Street which has been introduced but needs a committee date for the Land Use Committee. Third is the former Welsh Presbyterian Church on 14th Street in the Mission. That needs a board introduction. And then the Diamond Heights safety sculpture, which is at the board. However, just to give you a quick update, the Arts Commission and Public Works, they are still working on that MOA that I mentioned at a previous hearing, to ensure who is responsible for what portions of the artwork. So, I will give you an update on that likely in the New Year as that moves forward. I will point out that that may necessitate that Diamond Heights safety sculpture coming back to this Commission, depending on the content in that MOA and how it affects the ordinance. But, we will let you know about that in advance. And then lastly, as I am sure you have all seen, at the Planning Commission's decision on 49 Hopkins last week generated a lot of interest in the media. I'm happy to answer any questions or provide a formal report to you at a future hearing, but did want to make you aware of what the next steps would be after talking to the project planner, and also Tina Tam from our Enforcement Division. Basically because the project was approved with conditions under a Conditional Use Authorization, the owner has 30 days to respond with a new permit showing conformance and compliance with the conditions as outlined by the Commission. And if there is no response within that 30 days, we will initiate cancellation of the permit. And once the permit is cancelled, and then the Department would proceed with enforcement action. So, that is where it is today but again I am sure, as you know, many details will continue to develop around this project. I'm happy to talk to you about that in the future. That concludes my comments unless you have any questions.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Yeah, I just wanted to make one comment which was obviously it was the shot heard around the world. The articles were in the BBC, in the Washington Post, etc. all over. But what I found out yesterday was that the house is actually not considered a historic resource under CEQA. So, it's been characterized as a historic house and that is what is in the news about it. But it is sort of ironic that -- and I was concerned that the HPC and the preservation staff were left out of this action. And then I read the CatEx and find out that it wasn't a historic resource. So, it changes the whole dynamic. It doesn't change the media,

which is, you know, I think the Planning Commission did a very provocative thing to make a point. But it takes it out of our realm. I was particularly upset when I thought well this is a historic issue. We have been looking for ways for the Planning Commission and the HPC to come together and talk about things. I thought what a perfect item. Turns out it is not a historic resource. So, it does change the dynamic. So, thank you for following up with me on that. Thanks.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Wolfram:

Thank you. The only announcement I want to make is that we are looking to have a joint hearing with the Planning Commission to discuss issues such as this one that we just talked about. Also the review process for EIR's and we have -- looking at dates in later in January. And I think there's, I think I had forgotten to write the right date on my calendar. So the date that has been proposed was, the 17th wasn't working but the 24th may work or needs to be confirmed.

Commissioner Black:

Are you looking for a Thursday or Wednesday?

President Wolfram:

It would be a Thursday hearing. We would come to the Planning Commission's regular hearing and be on the -- I think in the beginning of that.

Commissioner Black:

Okay.

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

It will be Thursday morning probably about 10:00 am.

Commissioner Black:

Okay. So--

President Wolfram:

Oh that's right. In the morning before the Planning Commission meets.

Commissioner Black:

The 17th is --

President Wolfram:

I think the 17th is not...the 24th yes. So our secretary will be in touch with us to confirm the final date. And that concludes my report.

Commissioner Black:

Okay. Thank you.

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for ARC hearing on November 7, 2018](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC Special hearing on November 28, 2018](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC hearing on December 5, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

5. Commission Comments & Questions

None

6. Historic Preservation Fund Committee report by Robert Cherny

SPEAKER: Robert Cherny

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

7a. [2018-016406LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)

#8 FISHERMAN'S WHARF – located on Fisherman's Wharf northwest of the intersection of Taylor and Jefferson streets in the Fisherman's Wharf neighborhood. Assessor's Block 0006/001; 9900/047; Seawall Lot 302 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Alioto's Restaurant is a family-run seafood restaurant that has served San Francisco for 93 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Larry White – Bay View Boat Club
 + John Super – Bay View Boat Club
 + Dr. Kathleen Kennedy – For Your Eyes Only
 + Maria Davis – St. Mary's Pub
 + David Zouzounis – Ted's Market
 + Annette Alioto – Alioto's Restaurant
 + Diane Zuchi – Kimochi
 + Mary Elizah – Bay View Boat Club
 + Shanta Sacharoff – Other Avenues
 = Richard Carillo – Response to questions

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: 1005

- 7b. [2018-016408LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[489 TERRY A. FRANCOIS BLVD](#) – located in the Bayview neighborhood on the bank of the bay east of Mission Bay Boulevard. Assessor’s Block 9900/052 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Bay View Boat Club is a recreational boating club that has served San Francisco for 55 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a P (Public) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: [1006](#)

- 7c. [2018-016409LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[395 SUTTER STREET](#) – located in Union Square at the southeast corner of Stockton and Sutter streets. Assessor’s Block 0294/015 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Couture Designer European Clothing is a high-end European men’s clothing store that has served San Francisco for 29 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: [1007](#)

- 7d. [2018-016421LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[552 CASTRO STREET](#) – located in the Castro neighborhood between 18th and 19th streets. Assessor’s Block 0294/015 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. For Your Eyes Only Optometry is an eye care medical practice and eyewear retailer that has served San Francisco for 35 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and

promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the Castro NCD (Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1008](#)

- 7e. [2018-016422LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1715 BUCHANAN STREET – located in the Japantown neighborhood between Post and Sutter streets. Assessor’s Block 0685/042 (District 5). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Kimochi, Inc. is a nonprofit senior service agency that has served San Francisco for 47 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the Japantown NCD (Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 50-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1009](#)

- 7f. [2018-016621LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
3930 JUDAH STREET – located in the Outer Sunset neighborhood between 44th and 45th streets. Assessor’s Block 1799/018 (District 4). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Other Avenues is a cooperative food store that has served San Francisco for 43 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a NC-1 (Neighborhood Commercial, Cluster) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1010](#)

- 7g. [2018-016470LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)

3845 MISSION STREET – located in the Bernal Heights neighborhood between Crescent and Richland avenues. Assessor’s Block 5746/018A (District 9). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. St. Mary’s Pub is a neighborhood bar that has served San Francisco for 85 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1011](#)

- 7h. [2018-016504LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1530 Howard Street – located in the Western SoMa neighborhood between 11th and 12th streets. Assessor’s Block 3511/014 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Ted’s Market & Delicatessen is a neighborhood corner store and delicatessen that has served San Francisco for 51 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the WMUG (WSoMa Mixed Use-General) Zoning District and 55-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1012](#)

8. [2018-008948DES](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
906 BROADWAY – north side of Broadway between Taylor and Mason Streets, Assessor’s Block 0149, Lot 009 (District 3). Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors amendment of the **Landmark Designation** for Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, San Francisco City Landmark No. 204. Amend the landmark designation to include both the interior and exterior character defining features pursuant to Article 10, Section 1004(c) of the Planning Code. Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, both the exterior and interior, is significant for its association with the development of San Francisco’s Latino and Spanish-speaking communities from the late-nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century, for its architecture, and as the work of master architect, Shea & Lofquist, and master artist, Luigi Brusatori (interior murals). It is located within a RM-2 (Residential-Mixed, Moderate Density) zoning district and 40-X Height and Bulk district.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
 + Mike Buhler – Latino Historic Context Statement
 + Juana Villegas – Lady of Guadalupe
 + Mark Loper – Owner representative
 + Felix Ortiz – Instrumental people
 ACTION: Initiate Landmark Designation
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1013](#)

9. [2016-013216COA](#) (R. SALGADO: 415/575-9101)
900 NORTH POINT STREET - located at North Point Street between Polk Street and Larkin Street, Assessor's Block 0452, Lot 026 (District 2). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for alterations to the existing non-historic, open-air Carillon Building, located in the Terrace Plaza in Ghirardelli Square. The proposed alterations include enclosing the first floor by installing a glazed aluminum storefront system with a dark finish, with both fixed and single-hung glazing panels and glass-louvered transoms, between the existing structural steel columns of the building. The subject property is San Francisco Landmark No. 30, and is located within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with conditions

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report
 + Joshua Callahan – Project presentation
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RECUSED: Wolfram
 MOTION: [0364](#)

10. [2008.0014U](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
690 MARKET STREET – northeast corner of Market and Kearny streets. Assessor's Block 0311 Lots 016-069, 73-74, and 78-79 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending to the Board of Supervisors non-renewal of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into a contract with the owners of a qualified historical property who agree to rehabilitate, restore, preserve, and maintain the property in return for property tax reductions. The Board of Supervisors approved the historical property contract on November 18, 2008. The Board of Supervisors has expressed interest in limiting the historical property contract for 690 Market Street to a term of ten years in order to better achieve a balance between the benefits of the Mills Act and the costs to the City. The subject property is within a C-3-O (Downtown- Office) and 285-S Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: [1014](#)

11. (P. LAVALLEY: (415) 575-9084)

[HISTORIC RESOURCE ASSESSMENTS PILOT PROGRAM](#) – **Informational Presentation** regarding the Historic Resource Assessment-Pilot Program. The Historic Resource Assessment (HRA) provides preliminary feedback from the Planning Department regarding whether a property is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NR) and/or California Register of Historical Resources (CR) before development applications are filed. The Historic Resource Assessment (HRA) process is being undertaken by the Department as a Pilot Program in 2019.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Pillar LaValley – Staff report
ACTION: None - Informational

ADJOURNMENT – 2:40 PM
ADOPTED JANUARY 16, 2019