

SUNSHINE ORDINANCE TASK FORCE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO AGENDA

Hearing Room 408 City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

REGULAR MEETING

March 6, 2024 – 4:00 PM

(NOTE: Hearings on complaints will begin no earlier than 5:00 P.M.) (See below for additional details.)

Remote Access and/or In-Person Participation

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, in-person public comment, remote access for petitioners and respondents, and remote public comment via teleconference (via Webex).

Webex Remote Link/Log-in: https://tinyurl.com/sm8ns4cp Password: sunshine

Telephone Call-in:

1 (415) 655-0001 / Meeting ID: 2661 137 4382 ##

(press *3 to enter the speaker line)

Seat 1	Dean Schmidt	Seat 7	Matthew Yankee - Chair
Seat 2	Lila LaHood	Seat 8	Chris Hyland
Seat 3	Saul Sugarman	Seat 9	David Pilpel
Seat 4	Ankita Kumar	Seat 10	Thuan Thao Hill
Seat 5	Maxine Anderson	Seat 11	Bruce Wolfe
Seat 6	Laura Stein – Vice-Chair		

Ex-officio (non-voting) Clerk of the Board of Supervisors or his or her designee Ex-officio (non-voting) Mayor or his or her designee

Members of the public may participate by phone or may submit their comments by email to: sotf@sfgov.org; all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Sunshine Ordinance Task Force agendas and their associated documents are available at https://sfbos.org/sunshine.

Meeting Decorum: Any member of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force may call for decorum due to disorderly conduct of meeting participants. Persons who engage in threatening and/or menacing behavior may be asked to leave.

- 1. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA CHANGES.
- 2. Approval of the minutes from the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Meeting of January 31, 2024 and February 7, 2024. (Discussion and Action) (attachments)
- 3. **Approval of the Orders of Determination:** (Discussion and Action) (attachments)

File No. 20008: Complaint filed by Ann Treboux against Dwight Moore and the Office of the City Attorney

File No. 22115: Complaint filed by Mark Sullivan against Bruce Wolfe (Sunshine Ordinance Task Force;

File No. 22116: Complaint filed by Mark Sullivan against Bruce Wolfe (Sunshine Ordinance Task Force;

File No. 22034: Complaint filed by Gizelle Rabi and Karl Kramer against Crispin Hollings and the Sheriff's Department;

File No. 22047: Complaint filed by Gizelle Rabi and Karl Kramer against Ralph Remington and the Arts Commission

- 4. **Administrator's Report, Complaints and Communications**. (Discussion and Action) (attachments)
 - Task Force and Committee tentative hearing schedule with potential adjustments
 - Complaints and Hearing Requests
 - Communications
- 5. **File No. 23097 Hearing on Proposed Revisions to the Complaint Procedures and By-Laws:** Potentially adopt proposed revisions to the SOTF Complaint Procedures to expedite complaint processing per the Sunshine Ordinance requirements, and present and discuss related proposed changes to the SOTF By-Laws. (*Discussion and Action*) (attachments)
- 6. **Public Comment:** Members of the public may address the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force (SOTF) on matters that are within SOTF's jurisdiction, but not on today's agenda. *Public comment shall be taken at 5:00 p.m. or as soon thereafter as possible.* (No Action)
- 7. **CONSENT AGENDA** The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force shall review **File Nos. 21125, 22129 and 24003** to affirm the Committee's findings regarding the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force's jurisdiction; violations of the Sunshine Ordinance, Brown Act, or California Public Records Act; and, if applicable, to issue an Order of Determination and refer matters to a Committee for monitoring. The Complainant and Respondent are not required to attend the March 6, 2024, Sunshine Task Force meeting but may attend to provide testimony during the public comment period for this item related to the above-listed determinations. (*Discussion and Action*) (*attachments*)

File No. 21125: Complaint filed by Liza Murawski against the Department of Public Health for violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section 67.21, by failing to respond to a records request in a timely and/or complete manner.

(On November 28, 2023, the Education, Outreach and Training Committee referred the matter to the Task Force Consent Agenda with a recommendation for no violation. The Committee requested that the Department of Public Health treat this case as an Administrative 12.L.5(b) matter and conduct a review.)

File No. 22129: Complaint filed by HVSafe against the Police Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request for public records in a timely and/or complete manner.

(On January 23, 2024, the Education, Outreach and Training Committee referred the matter to the Task Force Consent Agenda with a recommendation for no violation. The Committee requested the Police Department communicate in writing with the petitioner to memorialize the procedures.)

File No. 24003: Complaint filed by Anonymous (ACU) v. Fine Arts Museum for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.5(b), by failing to make meetings of this policy body open and public and governed by the provisions of the Ralph M. Brown Act; 67.16 by failing to provide meeting minutes within 10 working days after the meeting.

(On February 20, 2024, the Complaint Committee, pursuant to the Petitioners statement of no contest to the complaint, referred the matter to the Task Force Consent Agenda with a recommendation to find a violation of Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s), 67.5(b) by failing to make meetings of open and public and 67.16 by failing to provide meeting minutes within 10 working days after the meeting.)

NOTE: Hearings on complaints and other agenda items listed below will begin no earlier than 5:00 P.M.

- 8. **File No. 22126** Complaint filed by Michael Petrelis against Supervisor Shamann Walton (Board of Supervisors) for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.29-5, by failing to provide required calendars of certain officials in a timely and/or complete manner. (Discussion and Action) (attachments)

 (On November 15, 2022 the Complaint Committee moved to find that the SOTF has jurisdiction, find that the requested records are public and to refer the matter to the SOTF for hearing.)
 - a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)

- 9. **File No. 23010** Complaint filed by Karl Kramer against Dennis Herrera, Charles Perl, and the Public Utilities Commission for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a request for public records in a timely and/or complete manner. (Discussion and Action) (attachments) (On April 18, 2023 the Complaint Committee moved to find that the SOTF has jurisdiction, find that the requested records are public and to refer the matter to the SOTF for hearing with the recommendation to find no violation.)
 - a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)
- 10. **File No. 23018**: Complaint filed by Ralowe Ampu against Fire Department for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a request for public records in a timely and/or complete manner. (*Discussion and Action*) (attachments)

(On April 25, 2023, the Compliance and Amendments Committee moved there is jurisdiction the records are public and forward to the SOTF with the recommendation to find a violation of 67.21(c) for failing to assist the requestor and directing them to the proper person.)

- a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)
- 11. **File No. 23020** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner. (*Discussion and Action*) (*attachments*)
 - **File No. 23036** Complaint filed by Paul Khina against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21 by failing to respond to a request for records in a timely and/or complete manner. (*Discussion and Action*) (*attachments*)

(On May 23, 2023 Education, Outreach and Training Committee requested that File Nos. 23020 and 23036 be combined and to find that the SOTF has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public and to refer the matter to the SOTF for hearing with a recommendation for violations of 67.25 for failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a complete and/or timely manner and 67.26 for failing to keep withholding to a minimum.)

- a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)
- 12. **File No. 23024** Complaint filed by Paul Kniha against the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.25, by failing to respond to an Immediate Disclosure Request in a timely and/or complete manner. (*Discussion and Action*) (*attachments*)

(On September 19, 2023 the Complaint Committee moved to find that the SOTF has jurisdiction, that the requested records are public and referred the matter to the SOTF for hearing with no recommendation but to determine the applicability of attorney/client exemption claimed.)

- a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)
- 13. **File No. 23033**: Complaint filed by Andrew J. White against the Department Police Accountability for allegedly violating Administrative Code (Sunshine Ordinance), Section(s) 67.21, by failing to respond to a request for public records in a timely and/or complete manner and 67.7(a) by failing to notice the hearing 72 hours in advance of the regular meeting, a policy body shall post an agenda containing a meaningful description of each item of business and 67.7(b) by failing to provide meaningful descriptions that are sufficiently clear and specific to alert a person of average intelligence. (*Discussion and Action*) (attachments)

(On July 25, 2023 the SOTF moved to continue Item to a future SOTF meeting for a full hearing. In addition, it was requested that the 3 handwritten pages not be included in future agendas and that the audio link from the committee meeting be sent to all members of the SOTF.)

- a) Hearing on the complaint. (Discussion and Action)
- 14. **Hearing Update on 2023 Annual Report.** (Discussion Only) (attachments)

SOTF members may view all documents and comment on narrative documents online. Members of the public may view all documents and send any comments to Lstein.sotf@gmail.com.

Update on the 2023 Annual Report

Members of the public can view these documents online or review the printed versions in the agenda packet. Any public comments on these documents can be sent directly to lstein.soft@gmail.com or made during public comment on this agenda item.

2023 Annual Report Links

- 2023 Annual Report Proposal by Member Stein,
 https://door.google.com/door.mont/d/1.Pik.Pv.P.M.
 - https://docs.google.com/document/d/1BjkPyPMxeBeuvVbFbcNg_1hvObB-
 - 71KX/edit?usp=sharing&ouid=105519330310899598939&rtpof=tr ue&sd=true
- Complaint Resolution Data 2023, https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mZIXGEXaTh8PRKToQ
 https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mZIXGEXaTh8PRKToQ
 https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mZIXGEXaTh8PRKToQ
 https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mZIXGEXaTh8PRKToQ
 https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mZIXGEXaTh8PRKToQ
 https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mzixgexath8
 <a href="https://docs.google.com/spreadshe
- Practical and Policy Problems in 2023,

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1YDZNhY8-5bFjLfc5jT42lel-O_P8MeVI/edit?usp=drive_link&ouid=105519330310899598939&rtpof=true&sd=true

- 2023 Draft Report, <u>https://docs.google.com/document/d/1 Gg9UQzXmUiwmb4YAlmg <u>0dk9YuKsj V9/edit?usp=drive link&ouid=1055193303108995989</u> 39&rtpof=true&sd=true
 </u>
- 15. Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items by Members of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Discussion and Action)

 (Note: Public Comment on this item is limited to subject matters presented by members of the SOTF.)
- 16. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force was established by the San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 67. The purpose of the Task Force is to protect the public's interest in open government and to carry out the duties enumerated in Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. For additional information concerning Sunshine Ordinance Task Force please contact the Task Force by e-mail sotf@sfgov.org or by calling (415) 554-7724.

Agenda Item Information

Each item on the agenda may include the following documents:

- 1) Department or Agency cover letter and/or report;
- 2) Public correspondence;
- 3) Other explanatory documents.

These items will be available for review at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, Reception Desk.

Meeting Procedures

1.	Complainant presents his/her facts and evidence	5 minutes	
	Other parties of Complainant present facts and evidence	Up to 3 minutes each	
2.	City responds	5 minutes	
	Other parties of City respond	Up to 3 minutes each	
	Above total speaking times for Complainant and City to be the same.		

- 3. Matter is with the Task Force for discussion and questions.
- 4. Respondent and Complainant presents clarification/rebuttal 3 minutes
- 5. Matter is with the Task Force for motion and deliberation.
- 6. Public comment (Excluding Complainant & City response, up to 3 minutes each witnesses)
- 7. Vote by Task Force (Public comment at discretion of chair on new motion and/or on new motion if vote fails.)

Public Comment will be taken before or during the Committee's consideration of each agenda item. Speakers may address the Task Force for up to three minutes on that item. During General Public Comment, members of the public may address the Task Force on matters that are within the Task Force's jurisdiction and are not on the agenda. Any person speaking during a public comment period may supply a brief written summary of their comments, which shall, if no more than 150 words, be included in the official file.

Each member of the public will be allotted the same maximum number of minutes to speak as set by the Chair at the beginning of each item, excluding persons requested by the Task Force to make presentations, except that public speakers using interpretation assistance will be allowed to testify for twice the amount of the public testimony time limit. If simultaneous interpretation services are used, speakers will be governed by the public testimony time limit applied to speakers not requesting interpretation assistance.

Each member of the public who is unable to attend the public meeting or hearing may submit to the City, by the time the hearing begins, written comments regarding the agenda items. These

comments will be made a part of the official public record. Written communications should be submitted to the SOTF at:

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102.

AGENDA PACKET: Available for review in the Office of the Clerk of the Board, City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, or on the internet at: http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine.

AUDIO RECORDINGS: Audio recordings of the meeting of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force are available at: http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine.

LANGUAGE INTERPRETERS: Requests must be received at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting to help ensure availability. Contact bos@sfgov.org or call (415) 554-7725.

AVISO EN ESPAÑOL: La solicitud para un traductor debe recibirse antes de mediodía de el Viernes anterior a la reunion. Llame <u>bos@sfgov.org</u> or (415) 554-5184.

Paunawa: Ang mga kahilingan ay kailangang matanggap sa loob ng 48 oras bago mag miting upang matiyak na matutugunan ang mga hiling. Mangyaring tumawag ka sa (415) 554-5184.

翻譯 必須在會議前最少四十八小時提出要求請電 (415) 554-7719

Disability Access

The hearing rooms in City Hall are wheelchair accessible. Assistive listening devices for the hearing rooms are available upon request with the SOTF Clerk. The nearest accessible BART station is Civic Center (Market/Grove/Hyde Streets). Accessible MUNI Metro lines are the F, J, K, L, M, N, T (exit at Civic Center or Van Ness Stations). MUNI bus lines also serving the area are the 5, 5R, 6, 7, 7R, 7X, 9, 9R, 19, 21, 47, and 49. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 701-4485. There is accessible parking in the vicinity of City Hall at Civic Center Plaza and adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex. Accessible curbside parking is available on Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place and Grove Street.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the SOTF Clerk at (415) 554-7724 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review.

For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 67) or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact: Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102; phone (415) 554-7724; fax (415) 554-5163; or email sotf@sfgov.org.

Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance by printing the San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 67 on the Internet at http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine.

Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices (Chapter 67A of the San Francisco Administrative Code).

Ethics Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code, Section 2.100] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 581-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site www.sfgov.org/ethics

Under Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code, Section 1.127, no person or entity with a financial interest in a land use matter pending before the Board of Appeals, Board of Supervisors, Building Inspection Commission, Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure, Historic Preservation Commission, Planning Commission, Port Commission, or the Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors, may make a campaign contribution to a member of the Board of Supervisors, the Mayor, the City Attorney, or a candidate for any of those offices, from the date the land use matter commenced until 12 months after the board or commission has made a final decision, or any appeal to another City agency from that decision has been resolved. For more information about this restriction, visit sfethics.org.