Date:	January 9, 2008	Item No.	3
		File No.	07080a

SUNSHINE ORDINANCE TASK FORCE

COMPLIANCE AMENDMENTS COMMITTEE AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST*

***************************************		., ·	
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
••••••			
npleted by:	Frank Darby	Date:	January 3, 2008

*This list reflects the explanatory documents provided

[~] Late Agenda Items (documents received too late for distribution to the Task Force Members)

^{**} The document this form replaces exceeds 25 pages and will therefore not be copied for the packet. The original document is in the file kept by the Administrator, and may be viewed in its entirety by the Task Force, or any member of the public upon request at City Hall, Room 244.

SUNSHINE ORDINANCE TASK FORCE



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-7724
Fax No. 415) 554-7854
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

ORDER OF DETERMINATION

November 27, 2007

November 29, 2007

Dan Boreen 3305 Third Street San Francisco, CA 94124

Rob Boughn San Francisco Fire Department 698 2nd Street San Francisco, CA 94107

Re: Complaint #07080a by Dan Boreen against the Fire Department for violation of Sections 67.24-67.27; 67.29-5 of the Sunshine Ordinance, and CPRA Section 6254 for alleged failure to provide records, failure to keep withholding to a minimum, failure to justify withholding, and untimely response.

Based on the information provided to the Task Force from the Complainant Dan Boreen, Respondent Rob Boughn, and hearing public comment, the following Order of Determination is adopted:

The Sunshine Ordinance Task Force finds the Fire Department in violation of Sections 67.26 and 67.27 for failure to keep withholding to a minimum and failure to justify witholding. The Fire Department is instructed to provide the "City-paid benefit" type the Department redacted from the time rolls provided to Mr. Boreen within 5 days after the issuance of this Order of Determination.

This Order of Determination was adopted by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on November 27, 2007 by the following vote: (Comstock / Pilpel)

Ayes: Craven, Knee, Cauthen, Chu, Comstock, Pilpel, Wolfe, Chan, Goldman, Williams

Doug Comstock, Chair Sunshine Ordinance Task Force

c: Ernie Llorente, Deputy City Attorney

17-16-40-180

NDO

NS

WORK DAY OFF

WORKERS COMP SUPP LV PAY

PAY TYPE VALUES

38M	STANDBY PAY
38T	STANDBY PAY (PLUMBERS)
	ADMIN LEAVE W/ PAY
ΑE	ADMINISTRATIVE LEAVE EARNED
AW	UNPAID AWOL
DP	DISABILITY LEAVE PAY
EP	EDUCATIONAL LEAVE W/ PAY
EX	EXECUTIVE LEAVE PAY
FH	FLOATING HOLIDAY PAY
FP	FUNERAL PAY
Н	WATCH OFF
HE	
HI	HOLIDAY (IN LIEU) LV PAY
HTC	HOLIDAY TIME COMING (OUT-BANK)
IDV	INDIVIDUAL DAY OF VACATION
JD ,	JURY DUTY LEAVE PAY
LH	LEGAL HOLIDAY LEAVE PAY
	LONGEVITY LEAVE PAY
ML	UNPAID MILITARY LEAVE
MP	MILITARY LEAVE PAY
OE	COMP TIME EARNED
OS	OVERTIME AT STRAIGHT TIME
OT	OVERTIME
OU	OVERTIME USED (OUT-BANK)
PB	PARENTAL LEAVE
	UNPAID PARENTAL LEAVE
FI	PARENTAL LEAVE
REG	
SD	UNPAID SDI LV WHEN SUPP
SE	TIME EARNED STRAIGHT
SL	UNPAID SICK LEAVE
SN	UNPAID SUSPENSION
5P	SICK PAY
SPI	SICK PAY (INJURY)
TC	COMP TIME PAY (OUT-BANK)
TRO	TRADE OFF
TRW 'A	TRADE WORK VACATION
VA NC	UNPAID WORKERS COMP LV
IVC	ONLY DAY OLL



FirePublicRecords/SFFD/SF GOV Sent by: Rhab Boughn

12/13/2007 10:04 AM

To SOTF/SOTF/SFGOV@SFGOV, Frank Darby/BOS/SFGOV@SFGOV Joanne Hayes-White/SFFD/SFGOV@SFGOV, Gary Massetani/SFFD/SFGOV@SFGOV, Kelly

Alves/SFFD/SFGOV@SFGOV, Mary

bcc

Subject Results of 12/12/07 C & A Committee Meeting, Re: Boreen v. SFFD

SOTF Members-

The following is a review of the results from last night's meeting, including comments/response:

(b) CD-1 CALENDAR [Chief Hayes-White]

This complaint was "TABLED"

SOTF Members would like to receive:

- Department Head Calendar Procedures: Write-up of how calendars are to be maintained
- Redactions are to be "keyed" in the future (per §67.26) include in procedure
- Copy of SFFD Request Policy & Procedures

The SFFD Public Records Request Policy & Procedures is available at the following URL: http://www.sfgov.org/site/sffd_page.asp?id=66933

<u>PLEASE NOTE</u>: During the meeting, Ms. Kraven referenced a case regarding disclosures of "substantial misconduct" (2006), which she alluded, broadened the scope of disclosures not exempt from disclosure per §67.24(c)(7). I request that she please provide information regarding the outcome of that case and substantiate the basis for her comment.

(c) CD-3 CALENDAR [Chief Massetani]

This complaint was "TABLED"

SOTF Members would like to receive:

- Copy of calendar presented to Mr. Boreen at hearing
- Non-Department Head Calendar Procedures: Write-up of how calendars are to be maintained
- Redactions are to be "keyed" in the future (per §67.26) include in procedure

(a) PAY TYPE

This complaint is to be continued at the next C&A Committee Meeting to be held on January 9, 2008

SOTF Members request the Department to:

- Provide response to SOTF & D Boreen by December 31, 2007
- Response to include:
 - o Pay Type Redaction Key (if any)
 - Legal justifications and legend/key for any & all redactions (per §67.26 & §67.27)
 - o All responsive documents requested by D Boreen adjusted & provided

(d) UNSIGNED TIME ROLLS

This complaint requires no further action.

• SOTF Members suggested to D Boreen that the issue of Time Rolls not being signed by officers is not within the scope of the Task Force, but should be taken up in another venue.

Thank You

Rhab Boughn Compliance & Public Records Officer San Francisco Fire Department Phone: (415) 558-3384 Fax: (415) 558-3407

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail message and any attachments are solely for the intended recipient and may contain confidential, proprietary, and/or privileged information protected by law. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, copying, use, or distribution of the information included in this message is prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender by reply e-mail, telephone immediately and permanently delete this message and any attachments. Thank you.

December 28, 2007

FROM:

Rhab Boughn, SFFD Compliance and Public Records Officer

TO:

Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, C & A Committee Members

SUBJECT:

Complaint No. 07080

ENCLOSURES: None

Dear Sunshine Ordinance Task Force Members,

This purpose of this letter is to provide supporting information to be considered for the next Compliance & Amendments Committee meeting to be held on January 9, 2008, regarding charges against the San Francisco Fire Department made by complainant Dan Boreen.

At the previous C & A Committee Meeting held on December 12, 2007, four (4) separate complaint items were reviewed for compliance. Those items involved the following subject matter: a) Non-disclosure of all 'Pay Type' codes; b) Chief of Department (Department Head) Calendar containing redactions; c) Form and content of non-Department Head Calendar; and d) Time Rolls not being signed by an officer. To date, the Minutes of that meeting have not been made available; therefore I shall hereby review the results of the December 12, 2007 meeting and include any additional comments. An e-mail reviewing the results of the December 12, 2007 meeting was also sent to the SOTF on December 13, 2007.

a) PAY TYPE-

"TO BE CONTINUED AT NEXT C&A COMMITTEE MEETING (January 9, 2008)"

SOTF Members request the Department to:

- Provide response to SOTF & Mr. Boreen by December 31, 2007
- Response to include:
 - Pay Type code redaction key (if any)
 - Legal justifications and legend/key for any & all redactions
 - o All responsive documents requested by Mr. Boreen adjusted & provided

Since the resolution of this matter involves the review and interpretation of several legal statutes, it is beyond the scope of the Department and the Public Records Officer. This matter is therefore being addressed by the Office of the City Attorney. To date, the Department has not received a response from the City Attorney's Office, as a final determination has not yet been made.

b) CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT [DEPARTMENT HEAD] CALENDAR-

"TABLED"

SOTF Members would like to receive:

- Department Head Calendar Procedures- Write-Up of how calendars are to be maintained in the future (what/what not to include)
- Redactions are to be "keyed" [per (§67.26) (§67.27(d))] include in procedure
- Copy of SFFD Public Records Request Policy & Procedures

The Department is still in the process of reviewing and creating a written procedure for maintaining and providing the Chief of Department Calendar. The Department anticipates the completion of this review prior to the January 9, 2008 Meeting.

The SFFD Public Records Request Policy & Procedures is available at the following URL: http://www.sfgov.org/site/sffd page.asp?id=66933. This policy and procedure is currently under review and shall be revised in 2008.

In addition, during the December 12, 2007 Meeting, a Committee Member referenced a legal case regarding "substantial misconduct" that, she alluded, broadens the interpretation of the SF Sunshine Ordinance, §67.24(c)(7), and occluded any justifications for such withholdings. If the Department is expected to re-interpret the SF Sunshine Ordinance beyond what is clearly stated in §67.24(c)(7) in order to be in compliance, I suggest the Committee provide the Department with clear legal justification in support of the allegations, and provide guidelines that must be adhered to by all City Departments.

c) NON-DEPARTMENT HEAD CALENDAR-

"TABLED"

SOTF Members would like to receive:

- Copy of Deputy Chief of Administration's Calendar presented to Mr. Boreen at the December 12, 2007 Meeting
- Non-Department Head Calendar Procedures- Write-Up of how calendars are to be maintained in the future (what/what not to include)
- Redactions are to be "keyed" [per (§67.26) (§67.27(d))] include in procedure

The SOTF was sent a copy of the Deputy Chief of Administration's Calendar via US Mail on December 21, 2007.

The Department is still in the process of reviewing and creating a written procedure for maintaining and providing Non-Department Head Calendars. The Department anticipates the completion of this review prior to the January 9, 2008 Meeting.

d) <u>UNSIGNED TIME ROLLS</u>-

"NO FURTHER ACTION"

• SOTF Members suggested to Mr. Boreen that the issue of Time Rolls not being signed by officers is not within the scope of the Task Force, but should be taken up in another venue.

This item therefore requires no further action on the part of the Department.

I hope the information provided has been helpful and will aid in your determination on these four (4) separate complaint items. If you have any questions or comments, please feel free to contact me at (415) 558-3384 or at FirePublicRecords@sfgov.org.

Thank You

Rhab Boughn Compliance & Public Records Officer

Cc: Chief of Department, J. Hayes-White Deputy Chief of Operations, R. Kochevar Deputy Chief of Administration, G. Massetani Assistant Deputy Chief of Support Services, L. Kalos Deputy City Attorney, K. Porter