



SUNSHINE ORDINANCE TASK FORCE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO MINUTES

Hearing Room 408
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

March 7, 2012 – 5:00 PM

Rescheduled Meeting

Members: Chair Hope Johnson, Vice-Chair Bruce Wolfe,
David Snyder, Richard Knee, Sue Cauthen, Suzanne Manneh,
Allyson Washburn, Jay Costa, Hanley Chan, Jackson West

1. **Call to Order, Roll Call, and Agenda Changes.** (00:00:01 –00:04:47)

The meeting was called to order at 5:17 p.m. Vice Chair Wolfe, Members Cauthen, Costa, and Chan were noted absent. There was a quorum. Member Costa was noted present at 5:40 p.m.

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to EXCUSE Vice Chair Wolfe and Member Chan.

Public comment: Jason Grant Garza spoke against the motion. Patrick Monette Shaw spoke in support of the motion.

The motion PASSED without objection.

2. Discussion of Survey of Costs of Compliance with City Sunshine Ordinance (00:24:33 – 1:27:06)

Task Force members discussed the Controller's survey of City agencies and departments, requested by Supervisor Scott Wiener, of costs of compliance with San Francisco's Sunshine Ordinance.

Member Washburn, seconded by Member Knee, moved that the Chair send a letter to Supervisor Wiener, on behalf of the Task Force, acknowledging the survey, expressing concern with the secrecy of the survey request, requesting clarification of motive and expected benefits, expressing concern with the survey instrument, offering input, and inviting Supervisor Wiener to attend a meeting to discuss the survey.

Public comment: Patrick Monette-Shaw; Thomas Picarello; Ray Hartz, Director, San Francisco Open Government; Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association; and Hal Smith spoke in support of the motion.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 - Snyder, Knee, Manneh, Washburn, Costa, West, Johnson

Absent: 1 – Cauthen

Excused: 2 – Chan, Wolfe

3. **File No. 11090:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by Patrick Monette-Shaw against the Controller's Office for not providing data in a requested format. (1:31:16 – 1:31:47)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to find jurisdiction.There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

4. **File No. 11090:** Hearing on complaint filed by Patrick Monette-Shaw against the Controller's Office for not providing data in a requested format. (1:31:48 – 2:49:10)

Complainant Patrick Monette-Shaw provided an overview of the complaint and requested the Task Force find violation. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of complainant. Respondent Monique Zmuda, Deputy Controller, provided an overview of the Controller's response and requested the Task Force dismiss the complaint. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of respondent. A question and answer period followed. Respondent did not provide a rebuttal. Complainant provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force to find violation.

Respondent stated the data requested by complainant existed in raw form and would require many hours to generate accurately in report form. The parties agreed to work to resolve the request with alternate data.

Member Snyder, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE THE MATTER TO THE CALL OF THE CHAIR.

Public comment: Ray Hartz, Jr., San Francisco Open Government, asked if program used to provide information to San Francisco Chronicle columnists Matier and Ross was still available. Peter Warfield inquired as to the purpose for the postponement of the item and for what result.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 - Snyder, Knee, Manneh, Washburn, Costa, West, Johnson

Absent: 1 – Cauthen

Excused: 2 – Chan, Wolfe

RECESS

The Task Force reconvened at 8:19 p.m.

5. **File No. 11095:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by Arnita Bowman against the Recreation and Park Department for allegedly not providing requested documents. (00:04:48 –00:06:20)

Complainant sent notice she would not be able to attend the hearing.

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the Task Force’s regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

6. **File No. 11095:** Hearing on complaint filed by Arnita Bowman against the Recreation and Park Department for allegedly not providing requested documents. (00:04:48 – 00:06:20)

Complainant sent notice she would not be able to attend the hearing.

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

7. **File No. 11096:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by Arnita Bowman against the Department of Parks and Recreation for allegedly not providing requested documents and delayed response. (00:04:48 – 00:06:20)

Complainant sent notice she would not be able to attend the hearing.

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

8. **File No. 11096:** Hearing on complaint filed by Arnita Bowman against the Department of Parks and Recreation for allegedly not providing requested documents and delayed response. (00:04:48 – 00:06:20)

Complainant sent notice she would not be able to attend the hearing.

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

9. **File No. 11097:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by Charles Pitts against the Police Department for allegedly not providing requested information. (Discussion and Action) (00:06:20 – 00:08:52)

Complainant requested a continuance.

Member Washburn, seconded by Member Knee, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

10. **File No. 11097:** Hearing on complaint filed by Charles Pitts against the Police Department for allegedly not providing requested information. (00:06:20 – 00:08:52)

Complainant requested a continuance.

Member Washburn, seconded by Member Knee, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

11. **File No. 11098:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by Ray Hartz, Jr. against Luis Herrera, City Librarian, for allegedly not including a brief written summary of his comments in meeting minutes. (3:06 – 3:08)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to find jurisdiction.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

12. **File No. 11098:** Hearing on complaint filed by Ray Hartz, Jr. against Luis Herrera, City Librarian, for allegedly not including a brief written summary of his comments in meeting minutes. (3:08 – 4:07)

Complainant Ray Hartz, Jr. provided an overview of the complaint and requested the Task Force find violation. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of complainant. Respondent was not present. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of respondent. A question and answer period followed. Deputy City Attorney Michael Karns responded to questions from Task Force members. Complainant provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force to find violation.

Member Washburn, seconded by Member Knee, moved (1) to find Luis Herrera in violation of Sunshine Ordinance Sections 67.16 and 67.21(e) for failure to include the 150-word summary of the Complainants's comments in the Library Commission meeting minutes and the Respondent's failure to appear at this hearing, and (2) refer the matter to Compliance and Amendments Committee.

Public comment: Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, said the Task Force should find that the Respondent committed a willful violation.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 - Snyder, Knee, Manneh, Washburn, Costa, West, Johnson

Absent: 1 – Cauthen

Excused: 2 – Chan, Wolfe

ORDERED DETERMINED and REFERRED TO COMPLIANCE AND AMENDMENTS.

RECESS

The Task Force reconvened at 9:25 p.m.

13. **File No. 12001:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly redacting requested speaker cards information. (4:12 – 4:13)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Manneh, moved to find jurisdiction.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

14. **File No. 12001:** Hearing on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly redacting requested speaker cards information. (4:13 – 5:17)

Complainant Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, provided an overview of the complaint and requested the Task Force find violation. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of complainant. Respondent Kate Patterson, Public Relations Director, Arts Commission, provided an overview of the Arts Commission response and requested the Task Force dismiss the complaint. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of respondent. A question and answer period followed. Respondent provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force dismiss the complaint. Complainant provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force find violation.

Member Washburn, seconded by Member Manneh, moved (1) to find the Arts Commission in violation of Sunshine Ordinance Sections 67.25(a) for failure to respond in a timely manner, 67.26 for failure to keep withholding to a minimum by providing unredacted speaker cards, and 67.27 for failure to justify withholding the redacted information; and (2) to refer the matter to Compliance and Amendments Committee.

The motion PASSED by the following vote:

Ayes: 7 - Snyder, Knee, Manneh, Washburn, Costa, West, Johnson

Absent: 1 – Cauthen

Excused: 2 – Chan, Wolfe

ORDERED DETERMINED and REFERRED TO COMPLIANCE AND AMENDMENTS.

15. **File No. 12002:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly routinely asking members of the

public to fill out speaker cards if they wish to speak, reinforcing the impression that they are required to do so. (5:17 – 5:18)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Manneh, moved to find jurisdiction.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

16. **File No. 12002:** Hearing on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly routinely asking members of the public to fill out speaker cards if they wish to speak, reinforcing the impression that they are required to do so. (5:18 – 5:42)

Complainant Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, provided an overview of the complaint and requested the Task Force to find violation. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of complainant. Respondent Kate Patterson, Public Relations Director, Arts Commission, provided an overview of the Agency's defense and requested the Task Force to dismiss the complaint. No speakers offered facts and evidence in support of respondent. A question and answer period followed. Respondent provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force dismiss the complaint. Complainant provided a rebuttal and again requested the Task Force find violation.

Respondent provided documentation demonstrating the Arts Commission has revised the language on its speaker cards to notify members of the public they are not required to submit speaker cards in order to speak at meetings.

Due to lack of a motion, the Task Force FOUND NO VIOLATION. MATTER IS CONCLUDED.

17. **File No. 12003:** Determination of jurisdiction on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly not allowing provisions for general public comment about the Bernal Heights Branch Library's historic multi-cultural Victor Jara Mural destruction and replacement. (5:43 – 5:44)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

18. **File No. 12003:** Hearing on complaint filed by the Library Users Association against the Arts Commission for allegedly not allowing provisions for general public comment about the Bernal Heights Branch Library's historic multi-cultural Victor Jara Mural destruction and replacement. (5:43 – 5:44)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Washburn, moved to CONTINUE the matter to the regular meeting of April 4, 2012.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

19. **General Public Comment:** (00:10:07 – 00:24:32 and 1:27:07 – 1:30:53)

A member of the public expressed concerns about the Library Commission splitting off 150-word comment summaries from their minutes. Patrick Monette-Shaw expressed concerns about his complaint pending at the Ethics Commission. Peter Warfield, Executive Director, Library Users Association, thanked the Task Force for changing the Task Force meeting day to Wednesday, and expressed concerns about the Library. Jason Grant Garza expressed concerns about what he termed lack of progress in handling complaints he has filed. Thomas Picarello expressed concerns about Jason Grant Garza's complaints, and suggested that Task Force meetings commence at 5:00 p.m. Ray Hartz, Jr. expressed various concerns.

20. **Administrator's Report** (5:44 – 5:45)

The Administrator's Report was reviewed.

Public comment: Peter Warfield suggested that more information be listed in the compliant log.

21. **Announcements, Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items** (5:45 – 5:46)

There were none.

22. **ADJOURNMENT** (5:46 – 5:47)

Member Knee, seconded by Member Manneh, moved to ADJOURN.

There were no speakers. **The motion PASSED without objection.**

There being no further business, the Task Force adjourned at 11:00 p.m.

APPROVED: October 1, 2014



**Victor Young
Administrator
Sunshine Ordinance Task Force**

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.